To: Rep. Kathy Castor, Chair, House Select Committee on the Climate Crisis  
Rep. Frank Pallone, Chair, House Energy and Commerce Committee  
Rep. Raúl Grijalva, Chair, House Natural Resources Committee  
Rep. Collin Peterson, Chair, House Agriculture Committee  
Sen. Lisa Murkowski, Chair, Senate Committee on Energy and Natural Resources  
Sen. John Barrasso, Chair, Senate Committee on Environment and Public Works

From: Scientists concerned about climate and biodiversity impact of logging

Date: 8 May 2020

Dear Members of Congress,

As forest and climate change scientists and experts, we are writing to urge you to oppose legislative proposals that would promote logging and wood consumption, ostensibly as a natural climate change solution, based on claims that these represent an effective carbon storage approach, or claims that biomass logging, and incinerating trees for energy, represents renewable, carbon-neutral energy.

We find no scientific evidence to support increased logging to store more carbon in wood products, such as dimensional lumber or cross-laminated timber (CLT) for tall buildings, as a natural climate solution. The growing consensus of scientific findings is that, to effectively mitigate the worst impacts of climate change, we must not only move beyond fossil fuel consumption but must also substantially increase protection of our native forests in order to absorb more CO₂ from the atmosphere and store more, not less, carbon in our forests (Depro et al. 2008, Harris et al. 2016, Woodwell 2016, Erb et al. 2018, IPCC 2018, Law et al. 2018, Harmon 2019, Moomaw et al. 2019).

Furthermore, the scientific evidence does not support the burning of wood in place of fossil fuels as a climate solution. Current science finds that burning trees for energy produces even more CO₂ than burning coal, for equal electricity produced (Sterman et al. 2018), and the considerable accumulated carbon debt from the delay in growing a replacement forest is not made up by planting trees or wood substitution (noted below). We need to increase growing forests to more rapidly close the gap between emissions and removal of CO₂ by forests, while we simultaneously lower emissions from our energy, industrial and agricultural sectors.

In your deliberations on this serious climate change issue, we encourage you to consider the following:

- The logging and wood products industries suggest that most of the carbon in trees that are logged and removed from forests will simply be stored in CLT and other wood products for buildings instead of being stored in forest ecosystems. However, this is clearly incorrect. Up to 40% of the harvested material does not become forest products and is burned or decomposes quickly, and a majority of manufacturing waste is burned for heat. One study found that 65% of the carbon from Oregon forests logged over the past 115 years remains in the atmosphere, and just 19% is stored in long-lived products. The remainder is in landfills (Hudiburg et al. 2019).

- Logging in U.S. forests emits 617 million tons of CO₂ annually (Harris et al. 2016). Further, logging involves transportation of trucks and machinery across long distances between the forest and the mill. For every ton of carbon emitted from logging, an additional 17.2% (106 million tons of CO₂) is emitted from fossil fuel consumption to support transportation, extraction, and processing of wood (Ingerson 2007). In fact, the annual CO₂ emissions from logging in U.S. forests are comparable to yearly U.S. emissions from the residential and commercial sectors combined (https://www.epa.gov/ghgemissions/inventory-us-greenhouse-gas-emissions-and-
The cumulative climate change impact of logging in the U.S. is even higher, since logging causes substantial reductions in carbon sequestration and storage potential in forests due to soil compaction and nutrient removal, and these combined impacts can often reduce forest carbon storage potential by 30% or more (e.g., Elliott et al. 1996, Walmsley et al. 2009).

- The wood products industry claims that substituting wood for concrete and steel reduces the overall carbon footprint of buildings. However, this claim has been refuted by more recent analyses that reveal forest industries have been using unrealistic and erroneous assumptions in their models, overestimating the long-term mitigation benefits of substitution by 2 to 100-fold (Law et al. 2018, Harmon 2019). The climate impact of wood is even worse if the reduced forest carbon sequestration and storage caused by nutrient loss and soil compaction from logging is included, as discussed above.

In countless public communications, and at numerous Congressional hearings, industry representatives have advocated for increased logging in the context of reducing wildland fire and related emissions. While small-tree thinning can reduce fire intensity when coupled with burning of slash debris (e.g., Perry et al. 2004, Strom and Fulé 2007) under very limited conditions, recent evidence shows intensive forest management characterized by young trees and homogenized fuels burn at higher severity (Zald & Dunn 2018). Further, the extremely low probability (less than 1%, Schoennagel et al. 2017) of thinned sites encountering a fire where thinning has occurred limits the effectiveness of such activities to forested areas near homes. Troublingly, to make thinning operations economically attractive to logging companies, commercial logging of larger, more fire-resistant trees often occurs across large areas.

Importantly, mechanical thinning results in a substantial net loss of forest carbon storage, and a net increase in carbon emissions that can substantially exceed those of wildfire emissions (Hudiburg et al. 2013, Campbell et al. 2012). Reduced forest protections and increased logging tend to make wildland fires burn more intensely (Bradley et al. 2016). This can also occur with commercial thinning, where mature trees are removed (Cruz et al. 2008, Cruz et al. 2014). As an example, logging in U.S. forests emits 10 times more carbon than fire and native insects combined (Harris et al. 2016). And, unlike logging, fire cycles nutrients and helps increase new forest growth.

We are hopeful that a new and more scientifically sound direction will be considered by Members that emphasizes increased forest protections, and a shift away from consumption of wood products and forest biomass energy, to help mitigate the climate crisis. We believe having a dialogue now would be productive, and we could help members of your Committees to be more effective in achieving the conservation and climate change goals that we share. We look forward to hearing from you and are available to provide additional scientific sources and serve as a resource for your Committees as you consider policy proposals on the climate crisis.

Sincerely,

*Lead Signatories*

*Affiliations listed for identification purposes only*
William R. Moomaw, Ph.D.
Emeritus Professor
The Fletcher School and Co-director Global Development and Environment Institute
Tufts University
Medford, MA, USA

Chad T. Hanson, Ph.D.
Forest Ecologist
Earth Island Institute
Berkeley, CA, USA

Dominick A. DellaSala, Ph.D.
Chief Scientist
Geos Institute
Ashland, OR, USA

George M. Woodwell, Ph.D.
Founder
Woods Hole Research Center
Falmouth, MA

James E. Hansen, Ph.D.
Director, Program in Climate Science, Awareness and Solutions
Earth Institute, Columbia University
New York, NY

William H. Schlesinger, Ph.D.
James B. Duke Professor of Biogeochemistry
Dean (Em.) the School of the Env., Duke Univ.
President (Em.), the Cary Inst. of Eco. Studies
Millbrook, NY

Peter H. Raven, Ph.D.
President Emeritus, Missouri Botanical Garden
George Engelmann Professor of Botany Emeritus,
Washington University in St. Louis
St. Louis, MO

Thomas Lovejoy, Ph.D.
Professor, Environmental Science and Policy
George Mason University
Fairfax City, VA
Senior Fellow, United Nations Foundation

Anne H. Ehrlich, Ph.D.
Center for Conservation Biology
Stanford University
Palo Alto, CA

Paul R. Ehrlich, Ph.D.
Professor Emeritus of Biology
Stanford University
President, Center for Conservation Biology
Palo Alto, CA

William Ripple, Ph.D.
Distinguished Professor of Ecology
Oregon State University
Corvallis, OR

Beverly Law, Ph.D., Professor Emeritus, Global Change Bio. and Terrestrial Systems Science
Department of Forest Ecosystems & Society
Oregon State University
Corvallis, OR

Mark E. Harmon, Ph.D., Professor Emeritus
Department of Forest Ecosystems & Society
Oregon State University
Corvallis, OR

Tara Hudiburg, Ph.D., Associate Professor
Dept. of Forest, Rangeland, and Fire Sciences
University of Idaho
Moscow, ID

Scott Goetz, Ph.D.
Professor, Carbon Cycle Science
Northern Arizona University
Science Lead, NASA Arctic Boreal Vulnerability Experiment
Flagstaff, AZ

Michael Dorsey, Ph.D., M.F.S., M.A.
M.F.S., Yale University, School of Forestry
M.A., The Johns Hopkins Univ., Anthropology
Ph.D., University of Michigan, School for Environment and Sustainability

Reed Noss, Ph.D.
President and Chief Scientist
Florida Institute for Conservation Science
Chuluota, Florida

Philip B. Duffy, Ph.D.
President and Executive Director
Woods Hole Research Center
Falmouth, MA
Richard A. Birdsey, Ph.D.
Senior Scientist, Woods Hole Research Center
Falmouth, MA
Volunteer, U.S. Forest Service

Wayne S. Walker, Ph.D.
Carbon Program Director
Woods Hole Research Center
Falmouth, MA

Richard A. Houghton, Ph.D.
Senior Scientist, George M. Woodwell Chair for
Global Ecology at Woods Hole Research Center
Falmouth, MA

Susan M. Natali, Ph.D.
Arctic Program Director
Woods Hole Research Center
Falmouth, MA

Jennifer Francis, Ph.D.
Senior Scientist
Woods Hole Research Center
Falmouth, MA

Susan A. Masino, Ph.D.
Vernon Roosa Professor of Applied Science
Trinity College
Charles Bullard Fellow (2018-2019)
Hartford, CT

Mary S. Booth, Ph.D., Director
Partnership for Policy Integrity
Pelham, MA

Juliette N. Rooney-Varga, Ph.D.
Director, Climate Change Initiative
Assoc. Prof., Environmental Science
University of Massachusetts
Lowell, MA

Barry R. Noon, Ph.D.
Emeritus Professor
Colorado State University
Fort Collins, CO

Scott Denning, Ph.D.
Monfort Professor of Atmospheric Science
Colorado State University
Fort Collins, CO

John Sterman, Ph.D.
Professor and Director
MIT Systems Dynamics Group
Sloan School of Management
Massachusetts Institute of Technology
Cambridge, MA

Lori S. Siegel, Ph.D.
P.E., Senior Modeler
Climate Interactive
Upper Valley, NH

Margaret (Meg) Lowman, Ph.D.
Director, TREE Foundation
National Geographic Explorer
Adjunct Professor, Arizona State University
Research Professor, Universiti Sains Malaysia

William L. Baker, Ph.D.
Program in Ecology/Department of Geography
University of Wyoming
Laramie, WY

Derek E. Lee, Ph.D.
Associate Research Professor
Penn State University
University Park, PA

Monica Bond, Ph.D.
Principal Scientist
Wild Nature Institute
Concord, NH

John Talberth, Ph.D.
President and Senior Economist
Center for Sustainable Economy
Portland, OR

Ernie Niemi
President
Natural Resource Economics
Eugene, OR

Eric Chivian, M.D.
Founder and Former Director, Center for Health
and the Global Environment
Harvard Medical School
Boston, Massachusetts

Dennis C. Odion, Ph.D. (posthumous)
Vegetation Ecologist
Earth Research Institute
University of California, Santa Barbara
Additional Signers

Nektaria Adaktilou-Landenger, Ph.D.
Science & Management Specialist, WVL, and
Service Assistant Professor
West Virginia Univ. / West Virginia Land Trust
Morgantown, West Virginia

William Anderson, Ph.D.
Professor Emeritus
Grice Marine Biological Laboratory
Charleston, South Carolina

Warren Arney, M.S.
Senior Wildlife Ecologist
Oregon Chapter The Wildlife Society
Portland, Oregon

Gregory H. Aplet, Ph.D.
Senior Science Director
The Wilderness Society
Denver, Colorado

A. Z. Andis Arietta, M.S.
Ph.D. Candidate
Yale University
New Haven, Connecticut

William Armbruster, Ph.D.
Senior Research Scientist
University of Alaska
Fairbanks, Alaska

Peter Bahls, M.S.
Executive Director/Conservation Biologist
Northwest Watershed Institute
Port Townsend, Washington

Jesse Barber, Ph.D.
Associate Professor
Boise State University
Boise, Idaho

Constance Dustin Becker, Ph.D.
Co-Director
Life Net Nature
Willcox, Arizona

Craig Benkman, Ph.D.
Professor
University of Wyoming
Laramie, Wyoming

Leslie Bishop, Ph.D.
Emerita Professor of Biology
Earlham College
Nashville, Indiana

Scott Black, M.S.
Executive Director
Xerces Society for Invertebrate Conservation
Portland, Oregon

Brian Bodenbender, Ph.D.
Professor of Geological and Env.Science
Hope College
Holland, Michigan

Elizabeth Borer, Ph.D.
Professor
University of Minnesota
Saint Paul, Minnesota

John Bowman, Ph.D.
Professor
Monash University
Melbourne, Australia

Buma Buma, Ph.D.
Assistant Professor
University of Colorado, Denver
Denver, Colorado

Philip Cafaro, Ph.D.
Professor of Environmental Ethics
Colorado State University
Fort Collins, Colorado

Ken Carloni, Ph.D.
Professor Emeritus
Umpqua Community College
Roseburg, Oregon

Kai Cham, Ph.D.
Professor
University of British Columbia
Vancouver, British Columbia

Donald Charles, Ph.D.
Senior Scientist
Academy of Natural Sciences of Drexel Univ.
Philadelphia, Pennsylvania
Robert Good, D.V.M., M.S.
Epidemiologist
USDA
Wellsville, Kansas

Steven Green, Ph.D.
Emeritus Professor
University of Miami
Coral Gables, Florida

Gregory F. Grether, Ph.D.
Professor
University of California Los Angeles
Los Angeles, California

Simon Gunner, M.S.
Botanist
Olofson Environmental, Inc.
Berkeley, California

James G. Hallett, Ph.D.
Chair, Society for Ecological Restoration
Washington, District of Columbia

Debora Hammond, Ph.D.
Professor Emerita, Environmental Studies
Sonoma State University
Cotati, California

John Harte, Ph.D.
Professor of Ecosystem Sciences
UC Berkeley
Berkeley, California

Susanna Hecht, Ph.D.
Professor
University of California
Los Angeles, California

Betsy Herbert, Ph.D.
Environmental scientist & freelance writer
Betsyherbert.com
Corvallis, Oregon

Karen Holl, Ph.D.
Professor of Environmental Studies
University of California Santa Cruz
Santa Cruz, California

Richard T. Holmes, Ph.D.
Emeritus Professor of Biology
Dartmouth College
Hanover, New Hampshire

Elizabeth Horvath, M.S.
Associate Professor, Biology
Westmont College
Santa Barbara, California

Malcolm Hunter, Ph.D.
Professor
University of Maine
Orono, Maine

Mark Hunter, Ph.D.
Earl E. Werner Distinguished Univ. Professor
Henry A. Gleason Collegiate Professor
University of Michigan
Ann Arbor, Michigan

Marc Imlay, Ph.D.
Natural Places Chair, Sierra Club
Bryans Road, Maryland

Alice Imlay, Ph.D.
Natural Places Chair, Sierra Club
Bryans Road, Maryland

Anne Jacopetti, M.A.
Retired Educator/Teacher
350Sonoma Steering Committee
Santa Rosa, California

Karl Jarvis, Ph.D.
Lecturer
Southern Utah University
Cedar City, Utah

Mitchell Johns, Ph.D.
Professor of Crop and Soild Science
California State University
Chico, California

Jacob Kann, Ph.D.
Aquatic Ecologist
Aquatic Ecosystem Sciences LLC
Ashland, Oregon

James Karr, Ph.D.
Professor Emeritus
University of Washington
Sequim, Washington

Maya Khosla, M.S.
Wildlife Biologist
Rohnert Park, CA
Bruce Kirchoff, Ph.D.
Professor
University of North Carolina at Greensboro
Greensboro, North Carolina

Rick Landenberger, Ph.D.
Science & Management Specialist & Asst.Prof.
West Virginia Univ. / West Virginia Land Trust
Morgantown, West Virginia

Marc Lapin, Ph.D.
Assoc. Lab Prof. & College Lands Ecologist
Middlebury College
Middlebury, Vermont

Peggy Lenaux, Ph.D.
Faculty
UC Berkeley
Berkeley, California

Alan Levine,
Director
Coast Action Group
Santa Rosa, California

Gene E. Likens, Ph.D.
President and Dist. Senior Scientist, Emeritus
Cary Institute of Ecosystem Studies
Millbrook, New York

Jay Lininger, M.S.
Principal Scientist
Pyrolysis LLC
Talent, Oregon

Frank Logindice, M.S.
Senior Instructor
University of Central Florida
Orlando, Florida

Chris Maser, M.S.
Social-environmental Sustainability
Corvallis, Oregon

Carl McDaniel, Ph.D.
Professor Emeritas (Rensselaer)
Visiting Professor Oberlin
Rensselaer and Oberlin College
Oberlin, Ohio

John McLaughlin, Ph.D.
Associate Professor
Western Washington University
Bellingham, Washington

Fergus McLean, B.S.
Retired forester
Sierra Club
Dexter, Oregon

Gary Meffe, Ph.D.
Conservation Biologist, retired
University of Florida
Gainesville, Florida

Douglas Meikle, Ph.D.
Processor of Biology
Miami University
Oxford, Ohio

Vicky Meretsky, Ph.D.
Prof., O’Neill School of Public & Env. Affairs
Indiana University
Bloomington, Indiana

Amy Moas, Ph.D.
Greenpeace USA
Oakland, California

Terri Moon, M.S.
Rohnert Park, California

John Morse, Ph.D.
Professor Emeritus
Clemson University
Clemson, South Carolina

Ellen Moyer, Ph.D., P.E.
Principal
Greenvironment, LLC
Montgomery, Massachusetts

Rob Mrowka, M.S.
Senior Scientist
Retired
Machias, New York

John Mull, Ph.D.
Professor of Zoology
Weber State University
Ogden, Utah

Pete Murphy, Ph.D.
Distinguished Professor Emeritus
Michigan State University
East Lansing, Michigan
Dennis Murphy, Ph.D.  
Emeritus Research Professor  
University of Nevada  
Reno, Nevada

K. Greg Murray, Ph.D.  
T. Elliot Weier Professor of Plant Science  
Hope College  
Holland, Michigan

James Murray, Ph.D.  
Retired Ecological Geneticist  
University of Virginia  
Charlottesville, Virginia

Phil Myers, Ph.D.  
Professor Emeritus  
University of Michigan  
Ann Arbor, Michigan

Knute Nadelhoffer, Ph.D.  
Professor, Dept. of Ecology & Evolutionary Biology and Director, UM Biological Station  
University of Michigan  
Ann Arbor, Michigan

Charles R. Neal, B.S.  
Ecologist  
USDA (retired)  
Cody, Wyoming

Robert Norman, Ph.D.  
Lebanon, New Hampshire

Richard Nyhof, Ph.D.  
Professor Emeritus  
Calvin University  
Grand Rapids, Michigan

Gordon Orians, Ph.D.  
Professor Emeritus  
University of Washington  
Seattle, Washington

Gustav Paulay, Ph.D.  
Curator & Professor  
University of Florida  
Gainesville, Florida

Timothy Pearce, Ph.D.  
Biologist  
Carnegie Museum of Natural History  
Pittsburgh, Pennsylvania

Barbara Peckarsky, Ph.D.  
Honorary Fellow and Adjunct Professor  
University of Wisconsin - Madison  
Madison, Wisconsin

Michael Pelizzari, Ph.D.  
Astrophysicist, retired  
Xero Carbon  
Milpitas, California

Esther Peters, Ph.D.  
Associate Prof., Env. Science and Policy  
George Mason University  
Fairfax, Virginia

Stuart Pimm, Ph.D.  
Doris Duke Chair of Conservation  
Duke University  
Durham, North Carolina

Roger A Powell, Ph.D.  
Professor Emeritus, Dept. of Applied Ecology  
North Carolina State Univ.  
Raleigh, North Carolina

Thomas Power, Ph.D.  
Professor Emeritus  
Univ. of Montana  
Missoula, Montana

James Quinn, Ph.D.  
Professor Emeritus  
Rutgers University  
New Brunswick, New Jersey

John Ratti, Ph.D.  
Professor and Research Scientist, Retired  
University of Idaho  
New Meadows, Idaho

Barbara Reynolds, Ph.D.  
Professor Emeritus  
UNCA  
Asheville, North Carolina

Fred M. Rhoades, Ph.D.  
Research Associate, Biology Department Western Washington University  
Bellingham, Washington

Dina Roberts, Ph.D., Professor  
CIIE Global Institute  
Vancouver, Washington
Terry Root, Ph.D.
Professor Emeritus
Stanford University
Stanford, California

Daniel Rosenberg, Ph.D.
Oregon Wildlife Institute
Corvallis, Oregon

Edwin Royce, Ph.D., Research Scientist (Retired)
Department of Plant Sciences
University of California at Davis
Davis, California

Matthew Rubino, M.S.
Research Scholar
North Carolina State University
Raleigh, North Carolina

Will Russell, Ph.D.
Professor
San Jose State University
San Jose, California

Robin Salter, Ph.D.
Professor Emeritus
Oberlin College
Oberlin, Ohio

Melissa Savage, Ph.D.
Assistant Professor Emeritus
University of California Los Angeles
Los Angeles, New Mexico

Carol Savonen, M.S.
Assistant Professor Emeritus
Oregon State University
Philomath, Oregon

Paul Schaeffer, Ph.D.
Associate Professor
Miami University
Oxford, Ohio

Rae Schnapp, Ph.D.
Conservation Director
Indiana Forest Alliance
Indianapolis, Indiana

John Schoen, Ph.D.
Wildlife Ecologist
Anchorage, Alaska

Tania Schoennagel, Ph.D.
Research Scientist
University of Colorado
Boulder, Colorado

Kathy Schwager, M.S.
Ecologist
Yaphank, New York

Dave Seaborg, M.S.
President
World Rainforest Fund
Walnut Creek, California

Mark Shapley, Ph.D.
Research Associate
National Lacustrine Core Facility
Minneapolis, Minnesota

Steve Sheffield, Ph.D.
Professor of Biology
Bowie State University
Bowie, Maryland

Diana Six, Ph.D.
Professor, Forest Entomology and Ecology
University of Montana
Missoula, Montana

Ann Sloat, Ph.D.
University of Hawai‘i
Oahu, Hawai‘i

Winston Smith, Ph.D.
Principal Research Scientist
Institute of Arctic Biology, University of Alaska
Juneau, Alaska

Copley Smoak, M.S.
Volunteer
Conservancy of SW Florida
Naples, Florida

Stefan Sommer, Ph.D.
Director of Education
MPCER, Northern Arizona University
Flagstaff, Arizona

Michael Soule, Ph.D.
Professor Emeritus
University of California
Paonia, Colorado
Wayne Spencer, Ph.D.
Chief Scientist
Conservation Biology Institute
San Diego, California

Anna Tyler, Ph.D.
Research Scientist
The Jackson Laboratory
Bar Harbor, Maine

Trygve Steen, Ph.D.
Professor, Env. Science and Management
Portland State University
Portland, Oregon

Rick Van de Poll, Ph.D.
Principal
Ecosystem Management Consultants
Center Sandwich, New Hampshire

Richard Steiner, M.S.
Conservation Biologist
Oasis Earth
Anchorage, Alaska

John Vickery, M.S.
Natural Areas Specialist
Denver, Colorado

James Strittholt, Ph.D.
President
Conservation Biology Institute
Corvallis, Oregon

David Wake, Ph.D.
Prof. of the Grad. School in Integrative Biology
University of California
Berkeley, California

Michael Swift, Ph.D.
Assistant Professor Emeritus
St. Olaf College
Northfield, Minnesota

Don Waller, Ph.D.
J.T. Curtis Professor of Botany, retired
Univ. of Wisconsin - Madison
Madison, Wisconsin

Alexandra Syphard, Ph.D.
Chief Scientist, Sage Insurance
Conservation Biology Institute
San Diego State University
San Diego, California

David Whitacre, Ph.D.
Instructor, Biology and Statistics
Treasure Valley Math and Science Center
Boise, Idaho

John Terborgh, Ph.D.
Professor Emeritus
Duke University
Durham, North Carolina

Norris Williams, Ph.D., Curator Emeritus
Florida Museum of Natural History
Gainesville, Florida

Stephen Tettelbach, Ph.D.
Professor Emeritus of Biology
Long Island University
Brookville, New York

Shaye Wolf, Ph.D.
Climate Science Director
Center for Biological Diversity
Oakland, California

Pepper Trail, Ph.D.
Ornithologist
Ashland, Oregon

David Wood, Ph.D.
Professor of the Graduate School
UC Berkeley
Berkeley, California

Vicki Tripoli, Ph.D.
Retired
Moorpark, California

George Wuerthner, M.S.
Researcher/writer
Public Lands Media
Bend, Oregon

Walter Tschinkel, Ph.D.
Professor Emeritus
Florida State University
Tallahassee, Florida
References

Bradley, C.M. C.T. Hanson, and D.A. DellaSala. 2016. Does increased forest protection correspond to higher fire severity in frequent-fire forests of the western USA? Ecosphere 7: article e01492.


