

To: European Commission President Ursula von der Leyen, Executive Vice-President Frans Timmermans and Commissioners Kadri Simson, Virginijus Sinkevičius, Jutta Urpilainen, Thierry Breton and Janusz Wojciechowski

From: Global Scientists (listed at end)

Re: Assessment of Forest Industry Response to EU Forest Strategy post-2020

Date: 4 July 2021

We are independent scientists who conduct research on climate and the carbon cycle, ecology and biodiversity of forests and related natural systems.

**The Swedish Forestry Industry has made the following points on the draft revised EU Forest Strategy:**

1. **The Commission makes unacceptable claims to decide over core forest policy issues**
2. **Forest management and planning should not be defined at the EU level, neither should the extent of the forest industry production.**
3. **It must be recognized that all different wood-based products and bioenergy are essential for a successful transition to a fossil free and circular bioeconomy.**
4. **Climate benefits of wood-based products and sustainable forest management must be fully recognized and understood via a system perspective.**
5. **No carbon debt or payback time accrues from harvesting operations in Swedish forestry (Holgrem).**

We fundamentally disagree with these five points as they are inconsistent with science-based evidence and knowledge of forest ecosystems, forestry and climate change. (Note - references are hyperlinks)

***Points 1 and 2 Forest management and Planning should not be defined at the EU level***

The European Commission wisely links addressing biodiversity and climate change in the EU Forest Strategy post-2020. This is consistent with the recent joint report by the International Panel on Biodiversity and Ecosystem Services and the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change issued on June 10, 2021 ([IPBES-IPCC](#) 2021). The opening section of the joint report states: “**Climate and biodiversity are inextricably connected with each other and with human futures.**” Both components must be addressed together.

A single governance regime like the EU is essential for assuring accurate forest carbon data and a uniform Monitoring Reporting and Verification (MRV) system based upon EU remote sensing and ground-based scientific capacity.

***Point 3 Wood-based products and bioenergy are essential for a fossil free and circular bioeconomy***

Claiming that wood-based products and bioenergy are essential for a “fossil free bioeconomy” is a value assertion that is not supported by quantitative analysis. The goal is not to be fossil free or to use renewable energy per se but rather it is “stabilization of greenhouse gas concentrations in the atmosphere at a level that would prevent dangerous anthropogenic interference with the climate system” ([UNFCCC Article 2](#) 1992). One-third of all the extra carbon dioxide added to the atmosphere since the beginning of the industrial revolution is from deforestation, forest degradation and land use change. Forests hold just half of what they once stored and therefore have enormous carbon retention potential. When coupled with deep and rapid cuts in fossil fuels emissions, alternative forest management practices that avoid emissions from logging and enable ongoing forest growth can transfer a significant amount of atmospheric carbon to forest and soil carbon stocks in the near-term ([IPBES-IPCC](#) 2021; [Erb](#) et al. 2018).

***Point 4 Climate benefits of wood-based products and sustainable forest management must be fully recognized and understood via a system perspective***

Indeed, wood based products and forest management need to be understood **quantitatively** within a time dependent systems framework of full carbon accounting ([Keith et al. 2021](#); [Law et al. 2018](#)).

In calling for more wood products it is assumed that all of them are less carbon intensive than alternatives, which is questionable in many cases ([Harmon 2020](#)). It is also often assumed that wood items are a permanent reservoir for carbon. In fact, wood is not a very durable material. Before rushing into a world of wooden buildings, it is important to understand their life-cycle. In the United States where most homes are made of wood, the average lifetime of a wooden house is 45 years and then it is torn down and relegated to a landfill where it decays and releases carbon dioxide back into the atmosphere. Houses in Japan have an even shorter existence. A U.S. study of the fate of forest carbon harvested in three west coast states from the beginning of the forestry industry in 1900 until 2015 found just 19% of the original carbon was in long-lived wood products like buildings and furniture, 16% was in landfills and 65% was in the atmosphere as carbon dioxide ([Hudiburg et al. 2019](#)). In a study of Australian forests, only 4% of the carbon found in a natural forest tree ended up in a sawn timber product which had a lifespan of greater than 30 years ([Keith et al. 2015](#)). What are the comparable values for Europe?

***Point 5 No Carbon debt or payback time accrues from harvesting operations in Swedish forestry.***

A recent analysis for the Swedish forestry industry ([Holmgren 2021](#)) concludes that there is no carbon debt from harvested forests because bioenergy replaces fossil fuels. Swedish forests have continued to grow while being harvested since 1980 because they are recovering from earlier 20<sup>th</sup> century losses, and annual removals from the atmosphere by growth in the total forest estate exceeds the emissions from the smaller area harvested. However, if there were less harvesting there would be two mitigation benefits: the avoided emissions from not logging the forests plus additional accumulated carbon stock from the ongoing forest growth. Holmgren's analysis actually reports less living forest biomass in the harvested scenario than in the no harvest and reduced harvest scenarios. The erasure of this carbon debt comes by claiming that fossil fuels replace the wood fuel in the no harvest scenario, and that burning wood fuel in the harvest scenarios has net zero emissions even though biomass power plants emit more CO<sub>2</sub> than fossil fuel plants per MWh ([Booth et al. 2018](#)). It seems highly unlikely that Sweden, where few fossil fuels are used, would substitute fossil fuels for the missing bioenergy in a no harvest scenario. By comparison, using quantitative dynamic full carbon accounting for bioenergy emissions and potential forest regrowth it is found that it takes decades to a century to erase the carbon debt from bioenergy in temperate forests ([Sterman et al. 2018](#)). Finally, in the Holmgren forest industry paper there is a qualitative claim that harvested forests accumulate more carbon in soils than do unharvested forests. This contradicts measurements that demonstrate harvesting depletes forest soil carbon rapidly because soil respiration continues to release carbon dioxide and there are fewer leaves, needles and fallen twigs and branches to be processed by bacteria and fungi into soil carbon.

## **Conclusion**

A productive, sustainably managed forestry industry can contribute positively to the European economy when it is balanced by a [proforestation management strategy](#) based on protecting the remaining primary forests and identifying a sufficient area of secondary forests that is managed for ongoing growth to meet climate and biodiversity goals. It has been found that **globally**, "...the largest one percent of trees in mature and older forests comprised 50 percent of forest biomass worldwide." ([Lutz et al. 2018](#)). These forests will **accumulate** significantly more carbon per hectare between now and 2050 or 2100 than will planting 3 billion trees in the next few years. Deciding which forests should primarily provide biodiversity and climate services is a political decision. Determining which forests will be most effective in accumulating carbon, and increase climate resilience and biodiversity must be guided by scientific analysis for informed decisions.

Please contact us by responding to the email if you need further information.

**Scientists with affiliations for identification purposes only**

William R Moomaw, PhD  
Professor Emeritus, Tufts University  
Distinguished Visiting Scientist  
Woodwell Climate Research Center  
United States

Alfredo Di Filippo, PhD  
Associate Professor in Plant Biology and Ecology  
National Geographic Explorer  
DAFNE, University of Tuscia  
Italy

Bengt Gunnar Jonsson, PhD  
Professor  
Department of Natural Sciences, Mid Sweden University  
Sundsvall, Sweden

William H. Schlesinger  
James B. Duke Professor of Biogeochemistry  
Dean (Emeritus) the School of the Environment, Duke University  
President (Emeritus), the Cary Institute of Ecosystem Studies  
United States

Hannes Dieter Knapp, Dipl.-Biol., Dr.rer.nat.  
Professor, Prof.u.Dir.a.D.  
Greifswald University, Succow Foundation  
Germany

Sorina Farcas, PhD  
Senior scientific researcher, Head of the institute  
Institute of Biological Research Cluj-Napoca  
Cluj-Napoca, Romania

Brendan Mackey, PhD  
Professor and Director  
Griffith Climate Action Beacon  
Griffith University  
Australia

Thomas E. Lovejoy, PhD  
University Professor  
Department of Environmental Science and Policy  
George Mason University  
Senior Advisor to the president United Nations Foundation  
United States

William F. Laurance, FAA, FAAAS, FRSQ  
Distinguished Research Professor  
James Cook University  
Cairns, Australia

Beverly Law, PhD  
Professor Emeritus, Oregon State University  
College of Forestry  
Oregon State University  
United States

John Sterman, PhD  
Jay W. Forrester Professor of Management  
Professor, System Dynamics and Engineering Systems  
Director, MIT System Dynamics Group  
Sloan School of Management  
Massachusetts Institute of Technology  
United States

Christine B. Schmitt, PhD  
Professor in Physical Geography with a focus on Human-Environment Research  
University of Passau  
Germany

Roel Brienen, PhD  
Professor  
University of Leeds, School of Geography  
United Kingdom

Gianluca Piovesan, PhD  
Professor  
University of Tuscia  
Italy

Guenter Hoch, PhD  
Senior Scientist  
Department of Environmental Sciences  
University of Basel  
Switzerland

George Woodwell, PhD  
Founding Director  
Woodwell Climate Research Center  
United States

Peter R Hobson (PhD; MSc; BSc)  
Professor Biodiversity Conservation and Sustainability  
Centre for Economics & Ecosystem Management, Writtle University College, Chelmsford, Essex,  
United Kingdom

Jeňýk Hofmeister, PhD  
Department of Forest Ecology  
Faculty of Forestry and Wood Sciences  
Czech University of Life Sciences  
Czech Republic

Nuria Selva dr hab.  
Institute of Nature Conservation  
Polish Academy of Sciences  
Krakow, Poland

R.A. Houghton, PhD  
Senior Scientist Emeritus  
Woodwell Climate Research Center  
United States

Andreas Fichtner, PhD  
Senior Researcher  
Institute of Ecology, Leuphana University  
Germany

Peter Raven, PhD  
President Emeritus  
Missouri Botanical Gardens  
United States

Mark E. Harmon, PhD  
Professor Emeritus  
College of Forestry  
Oregon State University  
United States

Alessandro Chiarucci, Prof.  
Full Professor of Applied & Environmental Botany  
Alma Mater Studiorum - University of Bologna  
Bologna, Italy

Aila Keto AO, PhD, Hon. DSc  
President  
Australian Rainforest Conservation Society Inc  
Australia

Pierre L. Ibisch, Dr. Dr. h.c.  
Professor for Nature Conservation and Research  
Professorship for "Ecosystem-based sustainable development"  
Centre for Economics and Ecosystem Management at Faculty of Forest and Environment -  
Eberswalde University for Sustainable Development  
Germany

Bartolomeo Schirone  
Professor of Silviculture and Forest Management  
DAFNE, Università della Tuscia  
Viterbo, Italy

Heather Keith, Ph.D.  
Griffith Climate Change Response Program  
Griffith University  
Australia

Tibor Standovár, PhD  
Associate Professor  
Department of Plant Systematics, Ecology and Theoretical Biology, Institute of Biology  
L. Eotvos University  
Hungary

Lisa Biber-Freudenberger, PhD  
Professor for Sustainable Development  
Center for Development Research at the University of Bonn  
Germany

Jennifer Francis, PhD  
Senior Scientist  
Woodwell Climate Research Center  
United States

Anna Scoppola, Dr.  
Full Professor in Environmental and Applied Botany  
Department of Agriculture and Forestry Sciences (DAFNE)  
University of Tuscia  
Viterbo, Italy

Brendan Rogers, PhD  
Senior Scientist  
Woodwell Climate Research Center  
United States

Richard Birdsey, PhD  
Senior Scientist  
Woodwell Climate Research Center  
United States

Juliette N. Rooney-Varga  
Professor, Environmental Science  
Director, Climate Change Initiative  
Co-Director, Rist Institute for Sustainability and Energy  
University of Massachusetts Lowell

Jacob Heilmann-Clausen, PhD  
Assoc. Professor  
Center for macroecology, evolution and climate,  
University of Copenhagen  
Denmark

Susan Natali, PhD  
Associate Scientist  
Woodwell Climate Research Center  
United States

Michal Zmihorski, PhD,  
Associate Professor,  
Mammal Research Institute, Polish Academy of Sciences,  
Białowieża, Poland

Wayne Walker, PhD  
Associate Scientist, Carbon Program Director  
Woodwell Climate Research Center  
United States

Mary S. Booth, PhD |  
Director, Partnership for Policy Integrity  
United States

Adrian Ruicanescu, PhD  
Senior Researcher  
Institute of Biological Research  
Cluj-Napoca. Romania

Stig-Olof Holm, PhD.  
Lecturer in ecology  
Umeå University  
Sweden

Grzegorz Neubauer  
Laboratory of Forest Biology  
Wrocław University  
Poland

Atsuhiko Iio, PhD  
Associate Professor  
Shizuoka University  
Japan

Malcolm L. Hunter, Jr., PhD.  
Libra Professor of Conservation Biology  
Dept. of Wildlife, Fisheries, and Conservation Biology  
University of Maine  
United States

Zoltan Kun, MSc  
Research Fellow  
Wildlands Research Institute  
University of Leeds  
Leeds, England UK

Parisa Panahi, PhD  
Associate Professor in Forestry  
National Botanical Garden of Iran  
Botany Research Division  
Research Institute of Forest and Rangelands  
Tehran, Iran

Dominick Della Sala, PhD  
Chief Scientist  
Wild Heritage, Project of Earth Island Institute  
United States

Tim Cadman, PhD  
Senior Research Fellow  
Research Fellow, Institute for Ethics, Governance and Law  
Griffith University  
Australia

Claudio Carere, PhD  
Associate Professor  
Department of Ecological and Biological Sciences  
University of Tuscia  
Italy



Keiko Kitamura, PhD  
Research scientist  
Forestry and Forest Products Research Institute  
Japan

Francesca Costabile, PhD  
Senior research scientist  
Institute of Atmospheric Science and Climate - National Research Council  
(ISAC-CNR)  
Italy

Goffredo Filibeck, PhD  
Assistant Professor of Plant Ecology  
University of Tuscia  
Italy

Thibault Leroy, PhD  
Assistant Professor  
Department of Botany and Biodiversity research  
University of Vienna  
Austria

Marco Gaetani  
Senior Researcher  
Head of CARISMA Research Centre  
Scuola Universitaria Superiore IUSS  
Pavia, Italy

Kateřina Holuřov, PhD et PhD  
Assistant Professor  
Mendel University in Brno  
Czech Republic

Kevin Cianfaglione, PhD  
Assistant professor (ATER)  
Universit de Lorraine,  
France

Fabrizio Buldrini, PhD  
Assistant Professor  
Dipartimento di Scienze della Vita  
Universit degli Studi di Modena e Reggio Emilia  
Italy

Marco Clericuzio  
Assistant Professor  
Università Piemonte Orientale  
Italy

Albert Vilà-Cabrera, PhD  
Postdoctoral Research Fellow, CREAM, Catalonia (Spain)  
Honorary Lecturer, University of Stirling  
Scotland (UK)

Martin Mikolas, PhD  
Post-doctoral researcher  
Department of Forest Ecology, Faculty of forestry and wood sciences,  
Czech University of Life sciences in Prague  
Czech Republic

Mihail Hanzu, Dr.  
Independent Technical Judiciary Expert in Silviculture, Forestry and Wildlife Management  
Office for Technical Experts of Sibiu Tribunal and  
SC SEMPER SILVA PROIECT SRL  
Romania

**Later signatures**

Mirko Liesebach, Dr.  
Head of unit provenance research and forest tree breeding, Senior scientist  
Thünen Institute of Forest Genetics  
Germany

Tomasz Wesołowski  
Emeritus Professor Laboratory of Forest Biology, Wrocław University  
Sienkiewicza 21, 50 335 Wrocław, Poland

Manuela Hirschmugl, Mag. Dr.  
AssistatProfessor.  
University of Graz & Joanneum Research  
Austria