

CHAPTER 9

Melville Smith
Organist, Educator, Early Music Pioneer,
and American Composer

MARK DEVOTO¹

Before American music became intercontinental, in the modern age of recording, broadcast music, and the jumbo jet, it was national, localized for the most part in major American cities and cultural centers, and for many of its most distinctive personalities this is still true today. The history of American music is marked by many excellent musicians who cultivated their own gardens; they did not rise to international prominence and are not listed in the standard musical reference works, but their activities in their own musical societies can still be reckoned objectively on a par with the best of their time anywhere, and their personal teaching and influence have remained durable for decades. One of these was Melville Smith, an organist, teacher, and all-around musician who, beginning in the 1930s, promoted the rediscovery of forgotten but treasured standards in organ building. Trained first at Harvard along German pedagogical lines like those of half a century before him, and then in France as one of the earliest of a long line of distinguished pupils of Nadia Boulanger, Smith developed as a performer and teacher who summarized the best of both traditions, at a time when the newly independent voice of American music was beginning to be recognized around the world (see Figure 9.1).

LIFE

Melville Machol Smith (he dropped the use of his middle name in his twenties) was born in Springfield, Massachusetts, on 6 July 1898, the fifth child and third son of Henry Joseph Smith and Jeannette (“Nettie”) Rose Machol Smith. His paternal grandfather, Wilhelm Schmidt



Figure 9.1. Melville Smith. Used by permission of Nathaniel Smith.

(1826–1882), had changed his name to Smith upon emigrating from Cologne to Rhode Island around 1860; his mother's father, from a Jewish family in Germany, had emigrated earlier, in 1847. Including one who died in infancy, Melville Smith had seven siblings. His oldest brother, Milton Smith, was at first a teacher at the Horace Mann School in New York, and was well known in the 1930s for his work as the Director of the Brander Matthews Theater at Columbia University.² Another brother, Everett Smith, two and one-half years older than Melville, taught at the Shady Hill School in Cambridge, Massachusetts.

Melville Smith attended public schools in Springfield and was a choirboy at Christ Church (Episcopal), where he began lessons on the organ with the choirmaster Thomas Moxon.³ After matriculation at Harvard College, he majored in music and played the piano for the newly-reorganized Harvard Glee Club.⁴ He graduated in the Class of 1920, *magna cum laude*, and was elected to Phi Beta Kappa.

Smith's distinguished undergraduate record earned him an Elkan Naumburg Travelling Fellowship from Harvard in 1920–1921, followed by a John Knowles Paine Fellowship for the next two years. The European experience was decisive; from 1920 to 1924 he remained chiefly in Paris at the *École Normale de Musique* as one of the very first American students of Nadia Boulanger.⁵ His studies with her included organ, piano, and composition as well as harmony and *déchiffrage* (sight reading of orchestral scores and keyboard realization of figured bass); it is fair to say that Smith's lifelong interest in the French organ repertory, both early and modern, was solidified by his work with Boulanger.

An excerpt from one of Smith's letters to Bernard DeVoto, dated 3 January 1922, reveals the delightful flavor of his days in France:

One of the young men, Jacques Bonjean, is a poet with a decided French temperament who has so fascinated and intrigued me—wrongly, I know, but *sic* (I am more and more susceptible as time goes on to uncensored impressions—and to tell the truth I invite them)—that I have been able to set some of his poetry with good effect. The enclosed program will show you that I am to make my first appearance on any stage day after tomorrow night with three of these songs. Properly speaking, the third is a product of Harvard days, which I made over this summer and dedicated to Nadia, she liked it so much. Jacques has translated it into French, and all is set for Thursday. Nadia is to play them, and Grislé is a very good contralto. Hosts of my friends are going as *clagues*—I guess it is—so altogether it ought to be amusing. I have written so little recently that I was pleased to find that the songs came easily and not half bad. I am still plodding at counterpoint, which is the basis of the technique of composition as 5-finger exercises are to piano technique—and relearning,—rather learning for the first time—the harmony which they professed to teach me at Harvard—but didn't. Apart from that I write a little every day, as free composition in the form of a piano prelude. So I was glad to come out of my shell and write something, and still gladder to find out if it is performable or not.

Everybody so far is pleased and impressed (including the poet, which is something).

The incomparable Nadia is as incomparable as ever. One day, about a month ago, when my feelings were again at a zenith, I had the courage to profess the extent of my affection for her. Since then my feelings towards her have lost much of their sexual stimulus and retained a deep love which I hope will endure. She understood me completely—she always does—and assured me that she is extremely fond of me, but added—in a sort of maternal way (was she serious?). At any rate, my former torment is gone, and if the sure fact of having stated what I thought was a deep emotion has diminished it, far better to have done so. Between us now exists a deep friendship and comradeship which is incomparable. What a woman! Perhaps when I see her again in Gargenville next summer—where I am to spend it, as last summer—a new stage will arrive in my feelings toward her. But at present, all is calm.—It transpires—or rather I have verified what I had always heard—that the celestial Nadia has had the *grand amour* and with her characteristic decisiveness has banished it from her life for ever—from the point of view from which the word “amour” is regarded in France, *id est*.—He was Raoul Pugno, the great French pianist, who died at the beginning of the war. To say that I admire her even more since knowing this is not necessary, to you! She is dead right—and the less French—for her mode of action. “Faire l’amour” is a common French expression—but unknown, I expect, to great souls.⁶

During that same spring of 1922, Smith traveled to Rome with Aaron Copland, who had joined Boulanger’s harmony class at Fontainebleau the previous summer. “Melville Smith went with me,” Copland wrote later. “He knew some Italian, and it was more fun than going alone. Melville was an enthusiastic type, even though relentlessly self-effacing.”⁷

It was in Rome that Smith met Howard Hanson, Director of the Eastman School of Music, who invited him to join the theory faculty there upon completion of his studies. Before beginning this appointment, Smith spent one year, 1924–1925, teaching at the David Mannes School, taking advantage of his stay in New York City to study organ with Lynwood Farnam. Smith remained at the Eastman School for five years, from 1925 to 1930, and during this time developed a comprehensive course in Fundamentals of Musicianship, “an adaptation of the Solfège system to the needs and attitudes of the American student and, as at present constituted, correlates work in harmony along with Solfège into a

thorough elementary course of music.”⁸ Within a few years, he crystallized the principles of this course in a textbook.

During his years at Eastman, Smith kept up an active schedule of performing. As pianist with the Lobero Trio, which included Olive Woodward, violin and viola, and Wendell Hoss, horn, he performed a substantial repertory of infrequently heard works as well as the beloved Trio by Brahms. The Lobero Trio was active between 1928 and 1932 and sometimes performed with a singer as well.

In 1931, at the behest of his Harvard classmate and fellow organist Arthur Quimby, Smith moved to Cleveland, Ohio, where he was appointed Associate Professor of Music at Western Reserve University. Over the next decade he taught theory from the freshman level all the way into the graduate program, including counterpoint and fugue. During this time he was organist at the First Unitarian Church of Cleveland and, between 1935 and 1939, the organist of the Cleveland Orchestra. He gave frequent recitals in the Cleveland Museum of Art, including one series, shared with Quimby, that covered all of the major organ works of Bach.⁹ In September 1936 he went back to Harvard for the Tercentenary celebrations, during which he shared a recital program in Memorial Church.

During summers from 1935 to 1940, Smith was a Lecturer in the Summer School at Northwestern University, teaching his finely honed methods of ear training to several hundred teachers who came to his workshops. In 1934 he published Volume I, and in 1937 Volume II, of his comprehensive textbook, *Fundamentals of Musicianship*, in collaboration with his Western Reserve colleague Max T. Krone. An abridged edition, for high school and junior college use, followed in 1940.

On 20 June 1937 Smith married Martha Belknap, a graduate student in art history at Western Reserve. In 1938–1939 Smith had a sabbatical year, and received a research grant from the Carnegie Foundation, which enabled the Smiths to travel to Europe. They spent a few months in Oxford, where Smith gave a recital at Hertford College, and did research on rhythm, folk song, and Morris dancing; the latter led him to Thaxted near Cambridge University, where he spent several days of Morris dancing with eighty men.¹⁰ For a while, he studied the harpsichord with Rudolph Dolmetsch. Moving on to the continent, the Smiths first visited the Benedictine Abbey at Solesmes, where he did some work with Père Gajard, and then went on to travel in Italy, Belgium, and eastern and northern Germany. Smith was much interested in the methods of organ building as practiced during Bach’s time, and many of the old instruments in Saxony

had been well preserved over the years or restored without significant alteration. With the approach of war rapidly darkening the scene in Germany, Smith was lucky to examine these fine Baroque organs, including the large organ in the Thomaskirche in Leipzig where Johann Sebastian Bach had played for twenty-seven years. Smith had some lessons with the choirmaster Günther Ramin at the Thomaskirche, but he was not to see any of the great European instruments again until nearly a decade after World War II.

The war in Europe had already been raging for a year when in late 1940 Smith was sought out by the Trustees of the Longy School of Music in Cambridge, Massachusetts, who were looking for a new director. The Longy School, founded in 1915 along French conservatory models, was a small and sparingly endowed but already distinguished school with a significant base in the Cambridge community. The most renowned member of its small faculty was Nadia Boulanger, now a refugee, who had first visited Longy at the behest of her former student, the Harvard composer Walter Piston, himself a member of the Longy Board of Trustees. Melville Smith, as one of Boulanger's own who had already an impressive record of teaching music theory to talented youngsters, college majors, and graduate students, was a natural choice to promote the newest styles of theory teaching at Longy, which was already beginning to look toward setting up a graduate program of its own. But it was also obvious that America would become involved in the European war sooner rather than later, and much uncertainty hung over the immediate future of the Longy School. Smith agreed with the Trustees that the school should stay open and remain as active as possible even if it meant, during the coming war, that there would be fewer faculty and students than usual, and that men would be scarce in either rank. The Trustees offered Smith a three-year contract at an annual salary of \$5,000, and he accepted on 5 February 1941.¹¹

Despite the complexities of moving from Cleveland and beginning a new position with heavy and unpredictable responsibilities, Smith was happy to move back to the city of his college years where he still had many friends. For a while Smith and his wife lived on Berkeley Place, a short distance around the corner from his college friend Bernard DeVoto. In 1943 the Smiths' only child, their son Nathaniel, was born. In 1947 the family moved into a house at 3 Healey Street, a five-minute walk from the Longy School. During parts of various summers, as time allowed, they spent time at the family farm in Leverett, Massachusetts, which Smith shared with his brothers and sisters.

The proximity of the Longy School to the Music Department at Harvard also meant mutual advantages; the Music Department regularly sent its talented Harvard and Radcliffe students to Longy for practical training as a supplement to their academic coursework.

The exigencies of the war years kept Smith busy hunting for operating funds as well as for students and faculty, but he was equal to the task. He was rewarded with strong support from his active Board of Trustees, especially his Harvard teacher Archibald T. ("Doc") Davison, who was elected President of the Board in 1942. In addition to Boulanger, several other notable European musicians had joined the Longy faculty, including the Russian soprano Olga Averino and the harpsichordist Erwin Bodky; Bodky established an early music program at Longy before he became a professor at Brandeis University. After 1945, enrollments grew steadily despite Boulanger's return to full-time teaching in France.

Smith continued to be active as a performer from the beginning of his return to the Boston area, accompanying singers on the piano at Longy, playing chamber music at college campuses, serving for seven years as organist and choirmaster at the Mount Vernon Congregational Church on Beacon Hill in Boston, and from 1956 until his death at the First Church in Boston (now the First and Second Church in Boston, Unitarian-Universalist, on the corner of Berkeley and Marlborough Streets). He also became increasingly well known as a harpsichordist, often featuring the instruments of distinguished local builders such as Hubbard & Dowd and Eric Herz.

During the 1950s the Longy School continued to expand its activities in every department, and the stately Abbot mansion at 1 Follen Street became increasingly pressed for space. Saturday morning assemblies in the Preparatory Department filled the large parlor; Smith often presided over these himself, coaching children in group singing of folk songs. Because there was no auditorium or recital hall, public recitals took place in the foyer, or, during good summer weather, on the back porch facing a large yard where chairs could be set up. Large events usually were held at Sanders Theatre at Harvard; beginning in 1951 these would include an annual Spring Festival of two or three concerts to raise money for scholarships. Smith often took part in these on the harpsichord, both as concerto soloist and continuo player.

In 1955, in his thirty-fifth Reunion Report to the Class of 1920 at Harvard, Smith mentioned that in addition to his position at Longy he was Instructor in Organ at Wellesley College, a position he continued to hold until his death. With characteristic but wry modesty, he wrote, "No

interests, no diversions, no publications, no charitable affiliations, no directorships—all these deficiencies make life quite simple and routine.”

In 1954 Smith led the first of what became a series of annual summer visits to Europe with fellow organists, touring various locations in France, Belgium, the Netherlands, and Denmark to play old instruments in local churches and analyze techniques of Baroque organ building and restoration. What he had studied in the prewar years now became a major focus of Smith’s performing activity. He took notes and made photographs, and lectured on his findings before professional groups.¹² He shared his ideas with Walter Holtkamp of the Holtkamp Organ Company of Cleveland, with whom he had served as a consultant ever since his Western Reserve years; Holtkamp built or rebuilt several important instruments in Cambridge with Smith’s consultation, including the large organ in the new Kresge Auditorium at the Massachusetts Institute of Technology and the small organ in the nearby Chapel, as well as the three-manual organ at St. John’s Chapel at the Episcopal Divinity School.

The expanding enrollments and diversified activities of the Longy School in the 1950s led to a renewal of a long-standing hope of the Longy Trustees, that the School should offer a program of studies leading to a degree along American lines, rather than the classical artist’s diploma according to European models. When Smith came to Longy in 1941, the plans were for a specialized graduate program, such as for the Master of Music degree; but the shaky financial status of the school during the war had forced an indefinite postponement of any such expansion. When the trustees took the matter up again, a different degree-granting arrangement was considered: Longy might affiliate with a nearby liberal arts college for joint matriculations leading to the Bachelor of Music degree. In 1956, Smith wrote to Tufts College in Medford, two miles away, about the possibility of a joint degree program, but nothing came from this overture.¹³

In 1957–1958, Smith temporarily stepped down as Director of the Longy School in order to work on recording and to accept an appointment as Visiting Lecturer at Harvard, where he taught the advanced harmony class; and the next year, 1959, he took on an additional part-time appointment to teach ear training and solfège at the New England Conservatory of Music in Boston, holding this position for two years. During his absence, the Longy trustees, working with the Acting Director, Kalman Novak, concluded an agreement with Emerson College in Kenmore Square in Boston to offer a joint degree. Seven students were ac-

cepted into the program for graduation in 1960. Presented with this accomplished fact on his return to active duty at Longy, Smith could do little but try to match his vision for the school to a new arrangement that he found essentially unsatisfactory. Whether or not the officials there knew of Smith’s lack of support for the joint affiliation, in 1958 Emerson College awarded him an honorary Litt.D. degree, of which he was proud.

During the next two years, Smith’s relationship with the Longy Trustees became increasingly strained, but he continued his busy schedule of teaching at three institutions, performing all over the Boston area, and doing his best to run the Longy School. Yet because of the expanded activities and mounting expenses, the day-to-day running of Longy had developed more and more into a full-time task that suffered under Smith’s divided loyalties and outside commitments. Smith acknowledged that he was not good at estimating finances and disliked the necessary details of preparing budgets. Several frictive incidents between Smith and other officers of the school distressed the trustees. A long internal memorandum from one of the trustees emphasized repeatedly the enduring achievements of Smith’s long service as director, as well as his outstanding abilities as a musician and teacher, but expressed regret that longstanding administrative problems had still not been solved, and that his “completely negative attitude toward the joint venture with Emerson” was a major obstacle to the further growth and progress of the Longy School.¹⁴

Matters came to a head in February 1961, when the trustees voted not to renew Smith’s contract for the coming year but to request him to accept a new status as Director Emeritus. Kalman Novak was appointed Acting Director for one year. In June 1961, after further discussions, Smith signed a new contract, naming him as “Director, on leave of absence 1961–62,” at a reduced salary. No public announcement was made that Smith’s leave of absence was actually the termination of his directorship of the Longy School, but the musical grapevine in Cambridge soon learned that he had been forced out, most likely because of the irreconcilable disagreement over the degree-granting issue. Smith himself reported, in a letter to Aaron Copland dated 5 November 1961: “I am not at Longy any more—you know me, I dont [*sic*] suffer fools gladly and the Board of Trustees is being run by a few ‘smart business men’ who want the school to be a factory, like all the others. So I am able to free lance and am having a fine time.”¹⁵

During this “fine time” of increased schedules of performing and recording, Smith suddenly achieved international recognition that was

widely reported in the musical press and the Boston newspapers; his recording of the complete *Livre d'orgue* of the French Baroque composer Nicolas de Grigny, issued on three LP discs by Valois Records, was awarded the Grand Prix du Disque—a point of justifiable pride for the Longy School as well as for its director. It was a labor of love, too; he never received royalties for this banner recording, not even an artist's fee.

In June 1962, just before his nominal leave of absence would have ended, the Longy School announced that Smith would retire from the position he had held for more than twenty years. Another letter to Copland is dated 6 July [1962] from Leverett, Massachusetts:

Dear Aaron

I write you on my 64th birthday. Horrid thought! Thanks for your letter. I am glad Mme. Salabert thinks well of the Passacaglia for organ. The only thing now is that I leave for Europe on an organ tour the 15th, and I cannot see how I can get time to do it before then. I must make a *good* copy (as you have pointed out) and I want to have time to think about it. Would early September be time enough? I should judge so.

Glad to hear about the Symphony. Don't forget that I am on the loose next year and if any opportunities should come up to play I should love to do so. . . .

Just called Tanglewood to learn that you will not be there this summer. Probably in China or some such place! How well you have managed your life!

All the best. I may see Nadia this summer en passant. I have a few days in Paris. I am enclosing a list of addresses in case you want to write me.

yours ever
Melville¹⁶

The plans thus outlined were not realized. A day or two before he was to leave for Europe, Melville Smith entered Mount Auburn Hospital in Cambridge with symptoms of high blood pressure. He had smoked cigarettes for most of his adult life but had given them up a few years earlier. A chest X-ray revealed an enlarged heart but a stress electrocardiogram showed no sign of danger, and his physician told him he should join the organ tour a few days late. On the morning of 16 July he was sitting up in bed in his hospital room having breakfast when he suffered a heart attack and died.

A memorial service was held at the Memorial Church in Harvard Yard on 19 July. A number of concerts and recitals later in the year were dedicated to Smith's memory at Columbia University, Wellesley College, King's Chapel in Boston, and at the Longy School, where a Harpsichord Fund was established in his name. One of the nicest tributes came on 11 December 1962 at Phillips Brooks House in Harvard Yard. The two-manual Hook & Hastings tracker organ, newly rebuilt by the Andover Organ Company, was dedicated as the Melville Smith Memorial Organ, in a recital by John Ferris, Lois Pardue, and members of the Harvard Organ Society and the University Choir.

In an editorial in the *Boston Herald*, an unidentified writer (possibly Robert Taylor) wrote: "Round-faced, bespectacled, Dr. Smith was the antithesis of flamboyance. But the clarity of his thought and the flash of his imagination belied his appearance. He was a great teacher, and quite capable of informing his students of a spring morning in his dry, crisp, even voice: 'There will be no class this afternoon in harmony. Enjoy your walk in the sun and attend Symphony. I can think of no better way to get the most out of this day.' That was the kind of man Melville was, whose life and art walked in the sun."

THE KEYBOARD ARTIST

Melville Smith's scrapbooks show that the majority of his performances on the piano occurred in his earlier professional years, especially when he was pianist with the Lobero Trio. In later years he played the piano chiefly as accompanist in vocal recitals and in chamber music. He played the piano in a number of concerts at Longy and elsewhere in Cambridge, including a Stravinsky concert when he was one of the players in the Concerto for Two Pianos Soli and the Sonata for two pianos; the Fauré Festival at Harvard in 1945; and a program of Beethoven sonatas with the Longy violinist Wolfe Wolfensohn.

As a harpsichordist he accompanied Bach's flute sonatas and much other Baroque chamber music, and frequently appeared as a continuo player, including at Jordan Hall at the New England Conservatory and the Boston Museum of Fine Arts, and in two programs with the American Bach Society in Town Hall in New York. One of the latter, on 27 January 1953, featured François Couperin's *Apothéose de Lully* in what was billed as the "first New York performance of [the] restudied and revised version by Melville Smith." Howard Taubman's review in the *New York Times* the next day mentioned the "revised version made by Melville

Smith, busiest performer in his place at the harpsichord last night.” His performing repertory of solo harpsichord pieces does not seem to have been very large (pieces by Louis and François Couperin, Rameau, Bach’s Italian Concerto, etc.), but a number of performances are listed in which he was soloist with chamber orchestra: the D minor Concerto, Fifth Brandenburg Concerto, concertos for two harpsichords, and the big Concerto for three harpsichords (with Erwin Bodky and Daniel Pinkham), all by Bach; and the rarely performed Concerto by Manuel de Falla (originally written for Wanda Landowska). Once he appeared as soloist in a Concerto dedicated to him, by Nicholas Van Slyck, who later would serve the Longy School as Director from 1962 through 1976.

The list of Smith’s performances on the organ is substantial, with sometimes as many as a dozen significant events yearly in addition to his Sunday preludes and postludes at churches. The repertory is wide but not comprehensive, with particular emphasis on the seventeenth and eighteenth centuries. He also performed select compositions from his own time, particularly by composers who were his personal friends, such as Copland,¹⁷ his Cleveland colleague Arthur Shepherd, Quincy Porter, Bruce Simonds, Robert Russell Bennett, and the Danish composer Finn Viderø. From time to time names from the conservative wing of the modern German school turn up: Reger, Heinrich Kaminski, Willy Burkhard. Smith showed less interest in the Romantic composers; one or two warhorses by Liszt (“Fantasy and Fugue on B-A-C-H”) appear among his scrapbooks, a few pieces by Brahms, nothing by Mendelssohn, Rheinberger, or Reubke, and only occasionally works by Widor or Vierne among the French organ symphonists. On the other hand, he showed a definite fondness for César Franck, especially the E Major Chorale and the *Prelude, Fugue, and Variation*;¹⁸ and selections from Tournemire’s *l’Orgue mystique* and pieces by the Belgian Paul de Malengreau turn up regularly. Though not a Bach specialist, Smith certainly had a thorough knowledge of all of Bach’s organ works, as we know from his series of recitals in Cleveland with his colleague Arthur Quimby and from many other programs.

Smith’s absorption in the early Baroque organ repertory began early. During the Cleveland years, his programs favored the German Baroque composers, along with twentieth-century works. Some of his favorite recital pieces came from Karl Straube’s popular anthologies for Peters Edition, *Alte Meister des Orgelspiels*: Sweelinck’s Variations on “Mein junges Leben hat ein End,” Arnolt Schlick’s chorale prelude on “Maria zart von edler Art,” Georg Muffat’s *Toccata Sexta*, and pieces by Giro-

lamo Frescobaldi, Domenico Zipoli, Jean Titelouze, Johann Kaspar Kerll, Georg Böhm, and Delphin Strungk.

But the emphasis in Smith’s middle career came to be increasingly focused on the French Baroque organ repertory. His ongoing involvement with the music of Nicolas de Grigny (1672–1703) can be traced as far back as a Cleveland recital of 1931, a time when this French master was still hardly known outside of France. Smith’s programs included François and Louis Couperin as early as 1939, with a variety of others such as Jean-François Dandrieu, Louis-Nicolas Clérambault, Nicolas-Antoine Lebègue, Pierre du Mage, and Louis Marchand appearing soon after his return to Boston. A recital at the Mount Vernon Congregational Church in November 1941 includes de Grigny’s great *Récit de Tierce en taille*, a work of melodic intensity and high drama that was a favorite of Smith’s.

His last years coincided with the widespread rediscovery of older methods of organ building, especially in the revival of tracker action, in which the motion of the individual key is directly transmitted via a mechanical linkage to the valve in the windchest, without the intermediation of switches and electromagnets. Long before the development in the late nineteenth century of the modern “symphonic” organ in France and England, tracker action in organ building had been brought to a fine craft, permitting exquisitely sensitive control with the player’s touch of the key. Smith was one of those who effectively restored this Baroque ideal; equally important, he argued passionately for the revival of older values in pipe construction and voicing. In a newspaper interview in 1938 or 1939 he said:

[These organs] are better than any that have been made since, and have been perfectly preserved. Germany considers these instruments national monuments and treats them as such, instead of tearing them out and replacing them as we do our old instruments. In Hamburg, North Germany, in the Jacobi Kirche I played on the Schnitger organ on which Bach played. It has been preserved just as in his time and is the finest I have ever heard.¹⁹

Returning to Europe in the 1950s, he found his ideal instrument for recording at the Abbey of Marmoutier, the oldest church in Alsace. This magnificent organ was built originally by Andreas Silbermann in 1710 in two divisions, including two reeds and three mixtures on the Great; in 1746 Silbermann’s son Jean-André added a short *Récit* and a pedal divi-



Figure 9.2. Melville Smith at the console. Used by permission of Nathaniel Smith.

sion. A modern restoration was carried out in 1955 with no alterations, preserving the original mechanical action and voicing. Smith's first recordings on the Marmoutier organ appeared with Cambridge Records, a small company maintaining the highest technical standards of the time; the expert recording engineer was Peter Bartók, son of the composer Béla Bartók. The prize-winning de Grigny records, also made at Marmoutier, were produced in France by Valois (see Figure 9.2).

A recent article by John Fesperman, who studied with Smith during his last years, gives extensive citations from an essay by Smith that apparently was never published. Smith defended the decision of the organ-

ist E. Power Biggs to install a new three-manual tracker-action organ by the Dutch builder Flentrop in the Busch-Reisinger Museum at Harvard in 1958, replacing the two-manual, fully electrified instrument by Aeolian-Skinner on which Biggs had played his Sunday broadcast recitals for many years. Smith's essay referred approvingly to the

foolish young Fulbrighters who, fresh from their studies in Europe, report that they like tracker action organs. . . . They are critical of the unmusicality and aridity of much that they hear [at home]. They see that European organists have been brought up in another world. . . . When they reflect further, they may decide that one of the contributory factors in their playing is the wonderful old organs upon which many students are privileged to study. . . . The Silbermanns, Schnitgers, Clicquot, to name but a few builders of an earlier epoch, were not such blundering incompetents, after all. Their work still stands today. . . . Find me an organ with electric action which, after forty years, approximately speaking, is still fit to play. If mechanically it still holds up, tonally it is probably a total loss, unless extensively altered since its construction.²⁰

For a recording of French Baroque music by Smith's disciple Frank Taylor, the organ historian Barbara Owen wrote:

The late Melville Smith was an educator, musician, and musicologist. His name is well-remembered in some small circles, and virtually unknown in the larger ones. It's their loss. He could give an imitation of a stuffy professor that fooled a lot of people and still has some of them fooled. But he cracked the mysteries of true and inner rhythm at a time when most musicians still believed that their only salvation lay in fawning slavery to the soul-destroying metronome.

And he went to France, and he had a love affair, and he won the *Grand Prix du Disque*. Now this love affair was a very personal thing between himself, the long-dead composer Nicolas de Grigny, and a very much alive classical organ in Marmoutier Abbey. These two taught him things which he brought back to America with him and taught in turn to his students.²¹

To which the organ builder Charles Fisk added:

When Melville Smith was alive, one's chief joy in building an organ lay in the knowledge that someday one might hear him play upon it.

Whenever I personally was in process of designing or voicing, the sound of his playing—his inimitable touching of the keys—was constantly in my head. . . . And how appropriate that the music [of this record] too should be Smith's favorite, the stuff that he first brought to us for us to learn, and eventually to know, and finally to love as though it were our own.²²

THE COMPOSER

Though it was not the primary focus of his profession, at various times in his life Melville Smith worked seriously at composition, chiefly during his college years and during his studies with Boulanger. His manuscript legacy, now at Harvard University, reveals the scope of his achievement as a composer; details will be found in Appendix I.

Smith's earliest works, on the evidence of the graphic style of manuscripts in his legacy, were songs. These include *Four Lyrics By Three Brothers*, Melville Smith's settings of three poems by Milton Smith and one by Everett. In 1979, seventeen years after Melville Smith's death, Martha Smith made a private printing of these songs from the manuscript; her conjectural date of these songs was "probably 1916," corresponding to the year that Melville entered Harvard. Very similar in graphic style, suggesting that it was composed about the same time, is another song, "In the garden of my heart," with unidentified text.

A letter (written 1935) from Bernard DeVoto to his friend Katharine Sterne mentions "the annual tone-feast of Harvard composers" at Paine Hall in the spring of 1920:

This one began with a couple of Melville Smith's songs, damned good as a matter of fact—it was before Melville's Nadia Boulanger period. . . . One, I remember, was Edward O'Brien's "Float out with me beyond yon sunset tide"—what a world it was in 1920—and the other was a lovely thing by BDeV, for, yes, dear, I wrote verse in those days.²³

Manuscripts of both of these songs were found in the legacy.

Four songs from Smith's Paris years were called *Dits*, three with French text by Jacques Bonjean and a fourth with text by Sara Teasdale, translated into French by Bonjean. Three of these were published in 1922 by Éditions Maurice Senart.²⁴

Melville Smith's largest work came from the Boulanger years: *The*

Weeping Earth for tenor solo, organ solo, chorus, and orchestra, composed in 1922 (see Figure 9.3). Of considerable power, this is a cantata in one movement, with a wide-ranging chromatic harmony seemingly influenced by such diverse sources as Debussy's *Le Martyre de Saint-Sébastien* and the later Scriabin. At the same time, *The Weeping Earth* reflects the explorations of its American contemporaries, with a feeling rather close to Charles Griffes's late works and to the youthful expressionism of Copland's *Grohg*, which was begun in the same year. The text of this cantata, by Patience Worth, is a cry of outrage in the aftermath of the Great War. It begins:

Chorus:

What! Is the Earth sodden of anguish,
Is she lain weeping, sobbing the fields,
and the tears scarlet!

Tenor solo:

White morning as thou comest,
Art thou not afear'd,
That thy mantle shall be stainèd,
Oh silver-footed Eve,
Art thou not fearful
That thou shalt bruise the torn breast of Earth
with thy step
Causing her to weep anew her scarlet tears.

One of the manuscripts carries a crossed-out indication that *The Weeping Earth* was written for the Harvard Glee Club; no performance by that group has been traced. What was probably the only performance took place in Severance Hall in Cleveland in 1932; a review dated 21 July of a concert by the chorus and orchestra of the Western Reserve University Summer Session stated:

But perhaps the biggest as well as the most exciting performance of the evening was Melville Smith's *The Weeping Earth*, for chorus, orchestra, and the fine tenor of Emanuel Rosenberg. Here is modern music, wonderfully orchestrated, contained, powerful and moving. The bitter sadness of many of its measures was perhaps the more effective in that from time to time the choral line became diffused and lost in the swelling orchestral themes.

Figure 9.3. A page from the autograph score of *The Weeping Earth*. Used by permission of Nathaniel Smith.

The Weeping Earth is also the only known work by Smith that includes the organ, his chosen instrument.

Another orchestral work, the short *Tarheel Fantasy*, dates from Smith's years at Western Reserve. It was first played by the Cleveland

Philharmonic under the direction of F. Karl Grossman in December 1940; another performance, by the Boston Pops Orchestra at Harvard Night, 10 May 1942, was conducted by Malcolm Holmes '28. The *Tarheel Fantasy*, "based on folk songs of North Carolina," is a medley of six tunes from Cecil Sharp's *English Folk Songs from the Southern Appalachians*; the harmonizations are derived from a notebook containing Smith's piano accompaniments of fifteen of these tunes.

The *Tarheel Fantasy* is but one facet of Smith's lifelong interest in folk song. Several unpublished arrangements of square dance melodies are another, and show his interest in folk dancing as well. While in Cleveland he published a choral arrangement of a folk song from Newfoundland; and through much of his performing career French noëls, many of them traditional folk melodies, formed a regular part of his organ repertory.

Smith's *Three Songs* on texts of Carl Sandburg appear to be his last composition. With the *Dits* and the three short choral pieces of 1933, these songs, published by the Valley Music Press in 1957, are his only published compositions. A program of a performance of the songs in 1955 at Wellesley College indicates that they were composed in 1944, but this date may refer to the copyright of Sandburg's texts. The skillful, contrapuntally expressive settings reveal a complex tonal idiom, sometimes with bitonal harmony, possibly influenced by composers like Milhaud and Roussel, and probably by Copland's Western style as well (see Figure 9.4).

Smith's last letter to Copland, quoted above, mentions "the Symphony." This was Copland's *Symphony for Organ and Orchestra*, commissioned by Nadia Boulanger in 1924 for her to play on her American tour; the premiere in 1925, with the New York Philharmonic under Walter Damrosch, was controversial at the time, although well received by public and press. Two years later, for practical reasons, Copland reorchestrated the work without the organ, as his *Symphony No. 1*. The original version remained unpublished for many years, and for a long time Smith, who much preferred it to the reorchestration, was probably the only other organist to perform it; four performances have been traced, the most recent in 1952 with the Boston Philharmonic Orchestra, with the orchestral parts lent for the occasion by the Fleisher Collection of Philadelphia.

At the time of his death in 1962, Smith had completed correcting proofs for his own organ-piano score of the Copland *Symphony*, which carries the copyright date of 1962 by Boosey & Hawkes (B. & H.

LOST

Adagio (♩=46)

Voice

p Des- o- late and lone All night long on the

Piano

p molto legato misterioso
con ped.

lake Where fog trails and

mp

mist creeps,

en dehors

poco meno p The whis- tle of a

From CHICAGO POEMS by Carl Sandburg. Copyright, 1916, by Henry Holt and Company
Copyright, 1944, by Carl Sandburg. By permission of the Publishers
Copyright 1957 by Melville Smith.

Figure 9.4. Melville Smith, "Lost," from *Three Sandburg Songs* (1957). Used by permission of Nathaniel Smith.

boat Calls and cries un- end- ing- ly,

mp Like some lost child In

molto espress
p Hunt- ing the har- bor's

breast And the har- bor's eyes.

pp
ppp

18914). Smith's prefatory note reads, in part: "The orchestra score is reduced for piano in such a way that it may be played in general by one pianist. In several places, the top stave must be played by the page turner, and in the Fugato at [52] in the third movement, the *lowest* stave must be played by the page turner." The orchestral score, originally copyright

1931 by the Cos Cob Press, was not published until 1980 (B. & H. 19029; Hawkes Pocket Score HPS 745); the first recording was by the New York Philharmonic under Leonard Bernstein, with E. Power Biggs as soloist.

THE TEACHER AND FUNDAMENTALS OF MUSICIANSHIP

Fundamentals of Musicianship, in two volumes of nearly two hundred pages each, is Melville Smith's most important publication in music pedagogy. Developed partly in Smith's teaching at Eastman and partly in collaboration with his colleague Max T. Krone, who headed the division of music education at Western Reserve, the book was published by Witmark Educational Publications, but has been out of print for many years. Yet much of the book makes good reading even today for its practical approach and its wide-ranging examples from masterworks of all periods and from many areas of folk song.

"The development of a serviceable feeling for time and rhythm is particularly stressed," the authors write in the Introduction. "While in the presentation of tonal problems the approach is first through the ear, in rhythmic training it is primarily through physical response and not through a mere understanding and writing of rhythmic notation. The system of rhythmic symbols and of rhythmic reading proposed in this work provides an easy transition from the former to the latter." The rhythmic symbols mentioned are in the form of continuous loops in a line, grouped according to beats in a measure and somewhat analogous to beat patterns in conducting; these are correlated to a precise system of counted metric syllables matching the beats.

Of no lesser importance from first to last is the perception of tonal functions:

The development of sight singing outlined in this work is based upon harmonic feeling rather than upon mere mechanical learning of intervals and scales. Good sight singing is musical interpretation. The reader must grasp at a glance the underlying musical significance of the passage to be performed. The sequence of tonal development here presented is directed towards a vivid appreciation of the harmonic structure underlying a melody as a means to its proper interpretation. . . . The presentation of chords before scales are studied, of intervals as part of chords, of melody tones as part of the harmonic background, and of rhythmic response before the traditional notation of rhythm is learned will all seem strange, to say the least.

Solmization syllables are not used, but the suggestion is made that letter names may be helpful. The authors recognize that the Movable Do system is popular in the public schools because it is easy to learn, but they stress that it is only a beginning, insufficient for advanced musicianship. Sight singing from the book is to be supplemented with the classic solfège series by Lavignac and Gédalge, and, most important, Volume 4 of E. C. Schirmer's Concord Series (the "Green Book"). Later, the sight singing book of choice for elementary use would be *Music-Reading*, compiled by Minna Franziska Holl, Smith's predecessor as Director of the Longy School; Holl's assistance is acknowledged in the Introduction to *Fundamentals of Musicianship*.²⁵

An abbreviated Table of Contents of *Fundamentals of Musicianship* is given in Appendix II.

In his curriculum vitae for publicity purposes in 1941, Smith mentioned that he was currently "working on a harmony book, which will incorporate a new idea of teaching this subject." No part of this project seems to have survived. It is possible, though regrettable, that the appearance that same year of the first edition of *Harmony* by his friend Walter Piston may have suggested to Smith that his own book might not be needed yet.²⁶

In the end, the remembered vitality of Melville Smith's teaching has outlasted his published influence as a pedagogue. As the composer and harpsichordist Daniel Pinkham wrote later:

He was a man of great integrity, and so encouraging to me when I was starting out. Melville and Martha Smith took me into their house like a member of their family. There was enough pepper in his disposition that he could not be silent in the face of disagreement. In his own right perhaps he never rose to the level of his potential, but as an influence he was one of the bright lights for an enormous number of people.²⁷

NOTES

¹Author's Note: This essay is written in tribute to the memory of a fine musician and a family friend.

When my father, Bernard DeVoto (1897–1955), returned to Harvard College after a two-year stint in the Army during World War I, he roomed for one year with Melville Smith. DeVoto did not attend his own graduation with the Class of 1920, but went back to his native Utah to get a job; nevertheless (or so the family story goes), Smith nominated him for Phi Beta Kappa and made sure that he was elected. They kept up an occasional but lively correspondence during

the subsequent years but did not see much of each other again until 1941, when Smith moved back to Cambridge to take up the directorship of the Longy School of Music. My own acquaintance with Melville Smith essentially began in 1946 with my childhood musical studies at Longy. Beginning in my teen years I had a few organ lessons from him, and I began to recognize him for the superlative musician and teacher that he was. I heard him play in a number of concerts as well as at my father's memorial service, and I remember that he presided over my entrance exam to the freshman harmony class at Harvard in 1957. Shortly after that, he began to make the recordings that consolidated, for a brief period before his early death, his growing international reputation as a Baroque keyboard performer.

I am grateful to John Howard and Virginia Danielson of the Eda Kuhn Loeb Music Library at Harvard University and Michael Rogan of the Bakalar Library at the Longy School of Music for valuable assistance in preparing this essay. I also wish to thank Elizabeth Roberts, David Fuller, and especially Nathaniel Smith and Lynette McGrath for personal recollections and information. I wish also to thank Wayne Shirley of the Music Division of the Library of Congress, and Tom House and Roland Goodbody of the Dimond Library of the University of New Hampshire, for their assistance in locating documents.

²See Anthony Tommasini, *Virgil Thomson: Composer on the Aisle* (New York, W. W. Norton & Company):378. Apparently Tommasini did not realize that Melville Smith and Milton Smith were brothers.

³The original organ of Christ Church (the church itself was reconsecrated in 1929 as Christ Church Cathedral, the seat of the Western Massachusetts Episcopal Diocese) was built in 1841 by E. and G. G. Hook of Boston. In 1885, a three-manual tracker organ was built by J. W. Steere & Son, a Springfield firm; in 1911, working from Moxon's specifications, Steere enlarged the instrument to four manuals with electropneumatic action and approximately forty-eight ranks, Opus 639. This would have been the organ on which Melville Smith received his first training. The firm of J. W. Steere & Son was later bought out by Aeolian-Skinner of Boston. I am very grateful to Peter Beardsley of Christ Church Cathedral for this detailed information.

⁴See Walter Raymond Spalding, *Music at Harvard: A Historical Review of Men and Events* (New York: Coward-McCann, Inc., 1935); and Elliot Forbes, *A History of Music at Harvard* (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1988).

⁵For a thorough chronicle of Nadia Boulanger's circle in the 1920s, see Léonie Rosenstiel, *Nadia Boulanger: A Life in Music* (New York: W. W. Norton, 1982). A photograph taken in 1923 of Nadia Boulanger with her students, including Melville Smith, is printed in Aaron Copland and Vivian Perlis, *Copland:*

1900 through 1942 (New York: St. Martin's/Marek, 1984):66. Another student in this photograph, identified as "Armand Marquint," is probably the composer Armand Marquiset; a volume of songs by Marquiset, inscribed to Smith "pour sa jolie voix," was found in Smith's legacy (see Appendix I). Aaron Copland also describes Boulanger's teaching in a conversation with Edward T. Cone, published in *Perspectives of New Music* 6/2 (Spring–Summer 1968):57–72, in which he mentions that Virgil Thomson came to Boulanger on Smith's recommendation.

⁶Unpublished letter in the Bernard DeVoto Archive, Special Collections, Stanford University. Gargenville, a village north of Paris, was the site of the Boulanger family estate: according to Rosenstiel, only Boulanger's best pupils were invited to study with her there during the summer. The song with English text would seem to be Smith's setting of "The Broken Field," by Sara Teasdale, which was translated by Bonjean as *Le Dit de celui qui connut la douleur*. It was not included in the published *Trois Dits* (see Appendix I).

⁷Copland and Perlis, *Copland: 1900 through 1942*:81.

⁸From Smith's curriculum vitae, prepared for the Longy School for use in news releases.

⁹The McMyler Memorial Organ in the Cleveland Museum of Art was built by Aeolian-Skinner. A much admired Rückpositiv division, playable from the Choir manual, was added later by Votteler-Holtkamp-Sparling Organ Company of Cleveland; Smith and Walter Holtkamp collaborated on the design of the rebuilt instrument. Smith continued as a consultant for the Holtkamp Organ Company until his death.

A report on the Bach programs appears in *The American Organist* 16/11 (November 1933): 555–556. A detailed article about the McMyler Memorial Recitals appeared a few months later [*The American Organist* 17/3 (March 1934):118–120], listing the specifications of the organ, with a photograph of Smith. The organ is further discussed in Smith's own article "Playing the Rückpositiv," and Holtkamp's "Building the Rückpositiv" [*The American Organist* 17/3 (March 1934):121–124]. Lee Garrett, in "American Organ Reform in Retrospect" [*The American Organist* 31/6 (June 1997):58–65], cites Smith's importance as a pioneering leader: "This was a singular event in American organ reform, marking the first direct collaboration between performer and builder in planning an organ for a specific repertoire."

¹⁰Smith's interest in folk dancing was lifelong and intersected frequently with his study of folk music. Some of the materials resulting from his dance studies are part of the Archives of the Country Dance and Song Society of America, now housed in Special Collections at the Dimond Library at the University of New Hampshire. These include a scrapbook with newspaper clippings, programs

(often annotated by Smith), and photographs, mostly from the years 1926–1928. Several folk dance events at the Eastman School of Music and in New York City are reported; there are also flyers and announcements from the English Folk Dance Society of London and affiliated chapters in New York and Rochester, and programs of events in Cleveland and at the Massachusetts Agricultural College in Amherst. Melville Smith's brother Milton is listed as Director of the New York Branch; Melville himself was on the Executive Committee and held various offices in the Rochester chapter. The several dozen carefully made photographs show various kinds of stick dances and sword dances, several with dancers in costume, including Melville Smith. One large clipping from an unidentified British newspaper, dated 4 June 1938, includes eight half-tone illustrations devoted to the "Morris men of Thaxted, Essex."

One musical manuscript was found in the collection, an orchestration (2–2–2–2, 2–2–0–0, timpani, tambourine, strings) of a dance in 6/8 meter, sicilianiana rhythm, entitled *Lumps of Plum Pudding*. 4 pp. 12-stave paper, medium folio, in pencil.

¹¹Some of this information derives directly from the Archives of the Longy School of Music. See also Jean McBee Knox, *Longy School of Music: The First 75 Years* (Watertown, MA: Windflower Press, 1991).

¹²I vividly remember Melville Smith's illustrated lecture, following an over-long business meeting, to the Boston chapter of the American Guild of Organists in the fall of 1958, sprinkled with pungent remarks. "A number of these instruments are very old; but I feel that all of them have aged considerably since the beginning of the meeting."

¹³Copy of letter in the Longy School Archives.

¹⁴Unsigned and undated document in the Longy Archives.

¹⁵Unpublished letter, Aaron Copland Collection, The Library of Congress.

¹⁶Unpublished letter, Aaron Copland Collection, The Library of Congress. Smith was not able, before his death, to make a new fair copy of his arrangement of Copland's *Passacaglia*, but he did leave two working manuscript copies.

¹⁷Smith arranged Copland's piano *Passacaglia* for organ with the composer's blessing (see the letter to Aaron Copland of 6 July 1962, above) and performed it many times.

¹⁸I remember my father's fondness for Franck's *Prélude, Choral et Fugue*, which he told me he first knew from Melville Smith's playing.

¹⁹From an unidentified clipping in Smith's scrapbook.

²⁰Quoted from John Fesperman, "A Twentieth-Century Perspective: Melville Smith," *The Diapason* (September 1996):16.

²¹Liner notes for Frank Taylor's recording of works by du Mage and Dandrieu, Elysée Editions (Wellesley College) SD 1001.

²²*Ibid.*

²³Unpublished letter, Bernard DeVoto to Katharine Sterne, 5 March 1935, Bernard DeVoto Archive, Special Collections, Stanford University.

²⁴A typewritten contract in French, dated 24 March 1922, for publication of *Trois Dits*, was found in the legacy. At just this same time, Aaron Copland signed a contract with Senart for publication of his *Passacaglia* and a song; see the facsimile of Copland's letter of 21 March 1922 to his parents, in Copland and Perlis, *Copland: 1900 through 1942*:79. This would have been only a few days before Smith and Copland traveled to Italy.

²⁵Holl's *Music-Reading*, with 346 examples in all the major and minor keys and church modes, was privately printed in 1942. During Smith's tenure, the Longy School, unlike nearly all others, remained resolutely a Fixed Do institution.

²⁶Piston's text is by now a classic exposition of the subject. The first edition of 1941 was followed by a second (1947), third (1962), fourth (1978), and fifth (1987), the last two edited and revised by the present author.

²⁷Quoted in Knox, *Longy School of Music*:69.

APPENDIX 1

Catalogue of Manuscript and Printed Works of Melville Smith. From the collection at the Eda Kuhn Loeb Music Library, Harvard University; gift of Nathaniel B. Smith

All manuscripts in ink unless otherwise stated.

Song, *In the Garden of My Heart*, one double sheet, ten-stave large octavo. "It was before I met you that my life was drab and drear, / I know not how I let you make it bright and crystal clear." thirty-two mm., four pp. Text unidentified. An additional double sheet, marked "In the Garden of my heart / 2nd verse." "Your words are gratifying / But they have been used before." Sixteen mm., three pp. Graphic style immature, probably earlier than 1920.

Song, *Whither away*, half of a double sheet, twelve-stave small octavo. "Whither away? Whither away? Love in the heart, shall hate come in?" Twenty-three mm., one p. Unsigned and undated.

Song, *Gregorian Ode*, one double sheet of fourteen-stave paper, small folio. Text by Edward J. O'Brien: "Ebb on with me across the sunset tide / And float beyond the waters of the world." Signed at top; dated "1918" in pencil. Thirty-one mm., three pp. Inside the folded sheet: the

same song on three sheets of vellum, fair copy by a copyist. Another copy of this song, title *Ebb on with me*—, thirty-one mm. On pp. 2–3. “To J. F. L.”

Song, *The Dead*, three single sheets of twelve-stave paper, folio. Autograph, but probably not in MS’s hand. Text by David Morton: “Think you the dead are lonely in that place?” Ninety-six mm., four pp.

Song, untitled: “The wind is hushed / The leaves are still.” Text not indicated (by Bernard DeVoto). One double sheet of fourteen-stave paper, small folio, in pencil, signed at the top: “M M Smith.” Forty-four mm., four pp. 1920 or earlier.

Song, untitled: “A garden is a lovely thing, / Where spring sweet grasses cool and green.” One double sheet of twelve-stave paper, folio. Thirty-five mm., three pp. Text unidentified. The refrain of this setting is pretty much identical, with some rearrangement of text, with that of “In the garden of my heart,” above.

Song, untitled: “I sometimes wonder why dark clouds are in the sky, / I sometimes wonder when bright days will come again;” One and one-half double sheets of ten-stave paper, folio, in red ink. Sixty-six mm., six pp. Text unidentified.

Song, *Le dit de celui qui se résigne*, forty-two measures on pp. 1–3 of a double sheet of fifteen-stave paper (five systems per page). Signed at end, similarly to above, “le 12 Dec. [sic] 1921.”

Song, *Le dit de celui qu'on attend*, sixty-eight mm. on pp. 1–3. “le 13 Dec, 1921.” p. 1: “à mon ami Maurice Gievre.”

Song, *Le dit de celui qui doit partir*, twenty-five mm. on pp. 2–3. Signed at the end: “Poésie de Jacques Bonjean. Melville M. Smith 1922.” The last digit of the year, 1, is overwritten 2.

Song, *Le dit de celui qui connut la douleur / The Broken Field*. Twenty-one mm. On pp. 1–3. at end: “Words by Sara Teasdale. / Paroles traduites de l’anglais par Jacques Bonjean.” Signed but not dated; probably composed at Harvard but revised December 1921 (see MS’s letter to DeVoto, 3 January 1922). This song was not included in the published *Trois Dits*, below.

A copy of the published score of *Trois Dits*, copyright 1922 by Éditions Maurice Senart, E. M. S. 4832, was acquired in 1963 by the Eda Kuhn Loeb Library at Harvard. This score shows many small differences from the foregoing autographs, mostly in terms of added expression marks and

articulations. The first song, *Le dit de celui qui se résigne*, is dedicated “à Mademoiselle Nadia Boulanger.” The second song, which in the autograph carries the title *Le dit de celui qu'on attend*, here has the title *Le dit de l'indifferent*. (A program in the legacy shows a performance of the *Trois Dits* at the Brookline Public Library, Massachusetts, 7 March 1961.)

Songs, *Four Lyrics / by / Three Brothers / Milton, Everett, and Melville Smith* [pencilled title on paper cover]. Blackline copies; twelve-stave folio paper. Incomplete copy (pp. 7–14 missing). These four blackline prints with individual paper covers; in envelope marked “Original MS,” together with the foregoing incomplete copy. The four songs are:

1. *Rovers* (Milton M. Smith), twenty-four mm. on three pp. “My lover he came like a bee to a clover / In black and yellow, all gallant and gay;”

2. *A New Carol* (Milton M. Smith), fifty-eight mm. on six pp. For voice and organ. Typewritten text, with typewritten organ registrations. “With the return of Christmastide / Men dream of angel choirs above,”

3. *An Olden Love Song* (Milton M. Smith), twenty-eight measures on four pp. “Show me the jeweler who cunningly carveth / A necklace to circle the throat of a queen,”

4. *A Song of Old Japan* (Everett H. Smith), eighty-eight mm. on five pp. “By the stream lay Yoki Kami / 'Neath her willow tree. / Sitting all alone and playing / Tunes of old Japan and saying, / 'Tell me, drooping willow tree, / Is my lover true to me?’”

Envelope, approximately 11” x 14”, marked [ink] “Negatives for Four Lyrics [pencil:] and paste up.” Includes eight yellow makeup sheets for negatives (two per sheet), plus another for a negative cover sheet. The cover sheet is typeset: “FOUR LYRICS BY THREE BROTHERS / Milton, Everett, and Melville Smith / Privately printed, 1979 / from Manuscript ca. 1916.”

Published score, *Three Songs*, Valley Music Press, signed, with corrections and additions: end of m. 11 (p. 2, third measure) “senza rit” at end; “*mp*” circled but “*mf*” added in voice in next measure, and “*p*” two measures later (“Hunt-”) etc. fingerings, conjectural rearrangings of voice part in Song 2. Included: two sheets three-hole 8–1/2” x 11” notebook staff paper with ink ms. of No. 1, *Lost*, few markings included.

Tarheel Fantasy, full score, twenty-six pp. in various inks, marked up in red and blue pencil with conducting indications. 2(+picc.)-2(+Eng.hn.)-2-2, 4-2-3-1, timpani, triangle, xylophone, cymbals, bass

drum, harp, piano, strings (9–7–6–5–5, pencilled in). Spiral wire bound, twenty-four stave-paper, heavy blue paper covers. With typewritten note on folksong origins, plus a collette of staff paper listing the six folksongs and texts:

1. The Green Bed
2. Rain and Snow
3. Sweet William
4. George Reilly
5. Pretty Nancy of Yarmouth
6. The Warfare is Raging

“The tunes were all collected by Cecil Sharp, and are published in *English Folk Songs from the Southern Appalachians*, Oxford Press.” Title page: “To Karl Grossman and the Cleveland Philharmonic Orchestra.” Some pages have revised passages, glued or taped in over the original. Last page indicates a durata of six minutes. All the harmonizations in this orchestral piece are based on the folk song arrangements enumerated below. With the full score is an apparently complete set of orchestra parts, handcopied except for strings, which are photocopies or blacklines of manuscript copies.

Folk song arrangements, in a folder in boards with loose double sheets, twelve-stave folio, ms. in ink. Thirteen of these are for piano solo. Pasted to each of these is a small separate sheet containing the original melody and text.

I. *Putnam's Hill*. “Sung by Mrs. Rosie Hughes at Woodbridge, Va.” “When I went over Putnam's Hill, / There I sat and cried my fill.” Signed in pencil at the top; at the bottom: “Melville Smith / Western Reserve University / Cleveland, Ohio.” Marginal marking next to pasted melody: “pentatonic.” Sixteen mm.

II. *The Wagoner's Lad*. “Sung by Miss Zilpha Robinson at Clay Co. Ky.” “I am a poor girl and my fortune's been bad, / So ofttimes I've been courted by a wagoner's lad.” Twenty-six mm.

III. *Rain and Snow*. “Sung by Mrs. Tom Rice at Big Laurel, N.C.” “Lord! I married me a wife, / She gave me trouble all my life.” Twelve mm.

IV. *The Tree in the Woods*. “Sung by Mrs. Jane Gentry at Hot Springs, N.C.” “There was a tree all in the woods, / Very nice and a handsome tree.” Nineteen mm.

V. *The Trooper and the Maid*. “Sung by Mrs. Tom Rice at Big Laurel, N.C.” “Feed your horse we're able, / Here's oats and corn for you, young man.” Nineteen mm.

VI. *The Cruel Ship's Carpenter*. “Sung by Mr. Hilliard Smith at [?]Hardman, Ky.” “O where is pretty Polly? / O yonder she stands.” Twenty-four mm.

VII. *Sweet William*. “Sung by Mrs. Rosie Hensley at Carmen, N.C.” “She run her boat against the main, / She spied three ships a-sailing from Spain.” With other penciled notes: “* sometimes sharpened” [referring to one note in the melody].” “M. B. acc. uses B^b, B[#].” Seventeen mm.

VIII. *Good Morning, My Pretty Little Miss*. “Sung by Mrs. Hester House at Hot Springs, N.C.” “Good morning, good morning, my pretty little Miss, / The beginning of my song.” Thirteen mm.

IX. *The Warfare is Raging*. “Sung by Mr. T. Jeff Stockton at Flag Pond, Tenn.” “The warfare is raging / And Johnny you must fight.” With second verse added in pencil. Eighteen mm.

X. *The Daemon Lover*. “Sung by Mrs. Bishop at Clay Co., Ky.” “Well met, well met, / my own true love.” Thirty mm.

XI. Unidentified (pasted-in melody missing), except for pencilled note: “Pretty Nancy of Yarmouth 184.” Another note: “bridge for No. 3.” Fifteen mm.

XII. Unidentified (pasted-in melody missing.) With a collette, two measures added to beginning. Total twenty-six mm. Entire song crossed out (?) with one diagonal line in pencil.

XIII. *Awake! Awake!* “Sung by Mrs. [?]Anelize Chandler, Allegheny, N.C.” “Awake! awake! You drowsy sleeper, / Awake! awake! it's almost day.” Twenty-nine mm.

XIV. *George Reilly*. “Sung by Mrs. Sarah Buckner, Black Mountain, N.C.” “As I walked out one cool summer morning / To take the cool and pleasant air.” Arrangement for piano four hands. Thirty-eight mm.

XV. *The Green Bed*. “Sung by Mrs. Jane Gentry at Hot Springs, N.C.” “O come you home, dear Johnny, / O come you home from sea? / Last night my daughter Polly was dreaming of thee.” For piano four hands, forty-six mm. Part of last sheet cut away, probably for pasting into something else. On back of double sheet: apparently sketches for harmonizations in *Tarheel Fantasy*, in pencil.

In the same folder: three double sheets of eighteen-stave paper with piano arrangements [in ink] of folk songs, simpler than the foregoing and without texts but identified by title:

[?] *Glosses Over*

Hullabaloo [crossed out in pencil]

Goin' to Boston

Duke of York [marked "Repeat until the last couple is coming through the arch." "D.C. as many times as there are couples."]

Goin' to Boston (revised) [crossed out in pencil]

O, Belinda (with two measures pencil sketch at bottom, text "Promenade around / O Belinda")

Weevily Wheat (mostly in eight-measure phrases marked with various segni and repeats, "A1," "A2," etc. through "A6" followed by "B (last time).")

Hullabaloo (more extensive than the one above)

Chorale and Fugue for mixed voices, two double sheets of twelve-stave paper, folio, with another double sheet as wrapper identifying composer as "James McCall" (pseudonym), and "Francis Boott Prize Competition, April 1920." Text: "Inclina, Deus, aurem tuam." 120 mm., seven pp. Chorale, eighteen mm., followed by *Fuga cromatica*: "Adspice Domine de sede tua."

Published choral score, *Lully, lullay*, Christmas carol, SSAA a cappella, Witmark Choral Library No. 2722, copyright 1933. Forty-three mm., five pp. Signed copy, with rubber-stamped "Longy School of Music." Text: same as the well-known Coventry Carol.

Published choral score, *Shepherds' Song (Terli, Terlow)*, SATB a cappella with oboe solo. Witmark Choral Library No. 2711, copyright 1933. Sixty-nine mm., seven pp. with oboe part on separate sheet. Text: "As I rode out this ender's night." Two copies, with Longy School rubber-stamp. Dedication: To the 1933 University Singers of Western Reserve University, Cleveland, Ohio.

Published choral score, *Noël*, SSAATTBB a cappella, Witmark Choral Library No. 2685, copyright 1933. Forty-nine mm., eleven pp. Text: "Noel, Noel, Tidings good I think to tell, / The boar's head that we bring here." Dedication: To Mr. Jacob Evanson and the Western Reserve University Choirs.

Published choral score, *She's Like a Swallow*, Newfoundland folk song, arranged by MS, SATB a cappella with baritone solo. Witmark Choral Library 5-W2937, copyright 1938. Text: "She's like a swallow that flies

so high, / She's like the river that never runs dry." Forty-six mm., seven pp. Dedication: for Mack Evans and The Midway Singers.

(No manuscripts of these choral works were found.)

Esquisse for flute, oboe, clarinet, and bassoon. Score, three double sheets of twelve-stave paper, small folio, in pencil. Sixty-seven mm., nine pp. With four instrumental parts, ms. in purple ink on four half-sheets of sixteen-stave paper torn in half. These parts are only for the first twelve measures of this piece; but they also include a "Scherzoso" movement of twenty-three measures that do *not* appear in the score, followed by a thirty-nine-measure third movement mostly identical with the last forty-three measures of the score.

Fugue, subject by Onslow. Two and one-half double sheets of fourteen-stave paper, folio. 144 mm., four pp., with an extra half-sheet showing alternative ending of twenty-eight mm. for the last eighteen mm. (or vice versa!), plus four further alternative bars in pencil; various corrections and erasures. G minor, $\frac{3}{2}$ meter, written in a severe *fugue d'école* style, probably for Boulanger.

The Weeping Earth, for chorus SAATBB, tenor solo, organ and orchestra. Poem by Patience Worth. 2-1-2-1, 3-2-1-0, timpani, cymbals, tamtam. Full score, photopositive, thirty-eight pp., sixteen- and twenty-stave paper, partially marked by a conductor. Another score, seventeen pp. of sixteen-stave paper, piano-organ-vocal reduction, partly in a copyist's hand (purple ink; apparently the same as the *Esquisse* parts, above), signed "Melville M. Smith, Gargenville 1922." This score has many corrections in pencil, black ink, etc., with collettes. With a set of orchestra parts, the strings separately handcopied. Additionally: a single chorus part without accompaniment; a solo organ part; an arrangement "pour choeur mixte et deux pianos;" Piano II's copy only; one chorus part, two black-line sheets folded in two, one-sided (four pp. total), ms. by a copyist; a negative photostat of a part for Violin I; and other miscellaneous pages.

APPENDIX II

Writings

A proper bibliography of Melville Smith's published writings is a task for the future. It would include occasional articles in *The American Organist* and a few other periodicals, liner notes and program notes for concerts, and contributions to newsletters. His most important publication is *Fundamentals of Musicianship*, of which an abbreviated Table of Contents is given here:

BOOK I (first published 1934)

Chapter 1: The Tone and Time Elements in Music

- Lesson 1 Section A: The Tone Element in Music
Section B: The Time Element in Music
- Lesson 2 Section A: The Organization and Grouping of Tones
Section B: The Organization and Grouping of Time Units, and of Tones Within the Time Unit

Chapter 2: Pitch and Time Notation

- Lesson 3 Section A: The Notation of Pitch
Section B: The Notation of Duration

Chapter 3: Major Chord Function and Spelling

- Lesson 4 Section A: The Harmonic Basis of Music. Major Chord Feeling
Section B: Alterations. Major Chord Spelling
- Lesson 5 Section A: Third Feeling
Section B: The Major Triad in All Positions

Chapter 4: Meter

- Lesson 6 Section A: The Metrical Grouping of Time Units
Section B: Irregular Groups Within the Time Unit

Chapter 5: Intervals

- Lesson 7 Section A: Intervals Based on Fundamental and Fifth Feeling
Section B: Intervals Based on Third Feeling

Chapter 6: Tonality and Scales

- Lesson 8 Section A: The Tonal Grouping of Chords
Section B: Harmonic Movement and Cadence Feeling
- Lesson 9 Section A: Major Scale Feeling
Section B: Scale Spelling and Key Signatures

Chapter 7: The Inharmonic and Chromatic Elements in Music

- Lesson 10 Section A: Inharmonic [*sic*] Tones. The Chromatic Scale
Section B: Inharmonic Tones in Melody. Dissonant Intervals

BOOK II (1937)

Chapter 1: Minor Chords and the Minor Mode

- Lesson 1 Section A: Minor Chord Feeling and Spelling Minor Chord Forms
Section B: Minor Key Construction. Cadences in the Minor Mode
- Lesson 2 Section A: Minor Scale Feeling

Section B: Minor Scale Spelling and Key Signatures
Supplementary Lesson: Modal Scales and Melody

Chapter 2: The Rhythmic Organization of Music

- Lesson 3 Section A: Extended Groups
Section B: Durational Accent, Ligature, and Syncopation

Chapter 3: Dissonant Triads and the Substitute Function of Secondary Chords

- Lesson 4 Section A: Diminished and Augmented Chord Feeling and Spelling
Supplementary Lesson: Non-tonal Use of the Augmented Triad
Section B: Secondary Triads in the Major and Minor Modes

Chapter 4: Chords of the Dominant Seventh and Ninth

- Lesson 5 Section A: The Chord of the Dominant Seventh
Section B: Chords of the Dominant Ninth

APPENDIX III

Discography

Precise dates for Melville Smith's commercial recordings have not been completely determined, but all of them were presumably made after 1956.

French Noels of the Seventeenth and Eighteenth Centuries. Cambridge Records CRS 505, monaural only.

A Treasury of Early French Organ Music. Two discs, Cambridge Records, CRS 506 and 507.

Songs by Francis Hopkinson and Poems and Ballads by Robert Burns. Thomas Hayward, tenor; Melville Smith, harpsichord. Cambridge Records, CRS 711 monaural, CRS 1711 stereo. A note on the jacket mentions that Smith died just as the record was about to be released.

Heinrich von Biber: Fifteen Biblical Sonatas for violin and continuo. Sonya Monosoff, violin; Melville Smith, organ and harpsichord; Janos Scholz, viola da gamba; John Miller, bassoon. Cambridge Records, CRS 811 monaural, CRS 1811 stereo. This recording was issued after Smith's death.

J. S. Bach: Complete Sonatas for flute and harpsichord. Philip Kaplan, flute; Melville Smith, harpsichord. Two discs, Boston Records, B 408 and 409.

Nicolas de Grigny: *Le Livre d'orgue*. Three discs, Disques Valois (Paris) MB 425, 426, 427 monaural; MB 925, 926, 927 stereo. Recorded 1960; Grand Prix du Disque, 1961. Smith's personal copy was numbered three hundred of a priority edition.