Anna O'Sullivan, Daisy Bonifant, Howie Scharlin, & Oliver Vonnegut Special Topics - Pre-College Philosophy

Class 6: Blame and Punishment

Materials:

- Room with a white board

Goals:

- Comprehensively interrogate the question of "Why punish?"
- Explicitly steer away from real-world scenarios that students might have preconceptions about
- Interrogate how and why we blame

Timeframe (minutes):

0-10 minutes: Sides of the room ~7 minutes per goal of punishment Remaining time: cumulative discussion

Lesson:

Start with the principle of charity spiel and also mention that this lesson is slightly more discussion-heavy, so it's fine to get up to stretch or go to the bathroom at any point.

Activity 1: Sides of the Room

- 1. Have you ever changed your behavior after being punished?
- 2. Have you ever changed your behavior out of fear of being punished?
- 3. Punishment helps you learn your lesson.

Question: What can punishment look like?

- Expected answers
 - Prison
 - Death penalty
 - Being grounded/having privileges taken away
 - Lecturing
 - Forcing somebody to apologize?
- Describe rehabilitation program. Is that a form of punishment?
- In this discussion, we are going to consider punishment as a response to an action that we don't want someone to repeat; it does not need to be a negative experience.

Write on the board: deterrence, incapacitation, retribution, and rehabilitation

[&]quot;These are the four commonly accepted goals of punishment."

- Deterrence means we punish someone as an example; we do it so that other people won't do the act that person did.
- Incapacitation means we take the person who did the bad action out of society so they can't do it again.
- Retribution means we punish someone because they deserve it. They did the bad action, so they have to accept the consequences of that action
- Rehabilitation means we "punish" someone to get them to a point where they no longer feel a need to offend when they are reintroduced into society

For each goal of punishment:

- 1. What does punishment with this goal accomplish?
- 2. Will this goal be met with punishment?
- 3. How would the punishment have to happen for this goal to be met?
- 4. Should punishment have this goal?
- 5. Who does punishment with this goal prioritize? (victim, perpetrator, community, etc.)

Goal-specific questions:

- Incapacitation/rehabilitation:
 - What about sociopaths? How should we punish people who objectively can never learn their lesson?
- Retribution:
 - Who gets to decide what is an appropriate punishment for a specific action?
 - What about functionally victimless crimes?

Culminating Discussion:

- Which of these goals do you think our current judicial system achieves?
- Are there any goals of punishment we missed?
- How much should the victim of a crime have a say in the perpetrator's punishment?
 - Why do they *deserve* a say?
- What goals would your ideal system of punishment achieve?